THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You say in two minutes whatever you want to say and then I will adjourn the House.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We should dispense with the lunch hour because this is an extremely important issue.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): No; how can it be? (*Interruptions*). There are Members here who would like to go for *namaz*. This is an important discussion. We can resume the discussion at 2.30 p.m. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have a look at the letter.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: If you want to adjourn the House for lunch, I would prefer resuming my speech after lunch. You adjourn it now and you have a look at the letter. I say this because my whole argument is based on this letter which the Joint Secretary in the Ministry of Home Affairs had sent to the Chief Secretary of West Bengal Government. This letter is the basis of my argument. On the basis of that, I will put questions to the hon. Minister. Therefore, you can adjourn the House now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will adjourn the House for lunch till 2 o'clock. You please come and show me the letter.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Yes; of course; no problem.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We will resume the discussion after that. The House is now adjourned for lunch.

The House then adjourned for lunch at fifty-nine minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at three minutes past two of the clock, THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) in the Chair.

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—Situation arising out of the airdropping of lethal weapons in Purulia posing a threat to National Security—*Contd.*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Now we will continue with the Calling Attention. The Private Members' Business will be taken up on some other day.

Gurudasji, you may continue with your speech.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, we have been discussing about the letter written by the Joint Secretary in the Ministry of Home Affairs to the Chief Secretary, Government of West Bengal. Since the hon. Chairman has allowed me to authenticate it and place it on the Table of the House, I shall read out the letter, and then I shall place it on the Table of the House.

[Placed in library. *See* No. LT 9420/96 and 9421/96]

Sir, the letter dated 12th December, 1995 is from Mr. Shashi Prakash, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs, Government of India, addressed to the Chief Secretary, Government of West Bengal. With your permission, I am reading out the letter. The letter says:

> "Reports available in the Ministry indicate that Europe-based businessman had approached an individual with a request to pilot a small plane between Karachi and Dhaka, delivering arms and ammunition en route to communist rebels in the area of Dhanbad....."

"It was suggested to the pilot that he could land at an airstrip 86.20 degrees east and 20.30 degrees north, which is located along a river with hills on either side and close to the normal commercial route from Karachi to Dacca. After unloading the arms, the plane could go on to Dacca with its legitimate cargo. The individual concerned is reported to have declined to take up the proposal. The arms dealer, who was arranging the supply of the weapons, is also learnt to have since pulled out of the deal on commercial grounds. Despite these setbacks, the businessman, who had approached the pilot, has since purchased an AN-26 aircraft. He left for Riga, Lativa on November 15, 1995 and was planning to travel to Pakistan. Hence there is a strong possibility that he is still pursuing the project...." (*Interruptions*) Sir, may I request the hon. Minister's help to kindly listen to the discussion? He is a Government representative.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Jagannath Mishra Ji, the hon. Member is speaking. Kindly don't interrupt.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: "Hence there is a strong possibility that he is still pursuing the project. According to a further information, which, however, requires corraboration, the insurgent group, which was to receive 2,500 AK-47 weapons and 15 lakh rounds of ammunition of Chinese make is opposed to CPM Government in West Bengal. The plane was to airlift the consignment of arms and ammunition to Karachi for storage by the side of the airport. From there the arms were to be placed aboard a small aircraft which would have been *enroute* to Dhaka, but could not make a brief unscheduled landing at a rough airstrip in an area called Panchat Hill near Dhanbad. Further inquries reveal that there is a vast expanse of flat land near Panchat Hill, which is located about five kilometres east of Nataria Police Station, Purulia District, West Bengal. This used to be utilised as a fair-weather airport for 20 years by Calcutta companies having an interest in Dhanbad collieries. This location is about nine kilometres south of Panchat Village and eight kilometres east of Chirkuda Police station in Dhanbad District of Bihar. The place is sparsely populated but for about 400 Mahto tribals. I shall be grateful if you would kindly sensitise the authorities concerned to be more vigilant and keep a close watch over the situation. We may also please be apprised of the developments, if any, in this regard."

Sir, this is the letter. This letter is very sensitive and it gives all the details about the conspiracy that was going on in Europe and also in some of our neighbouring countries. It affects vitally our national defence, national security and national well-being. There is no question of our taking a partisan stand. But, equally it will be unpardonable if we gloss over the mistakes or serious lapses that there are in the behaviour of the Government. It is not to take any political advantage, but to ensure that it never recurs in future. With that perspective in mind, Sir, I seek to continue the discussion. The point, therefore, is that the Government of India knew what the plan was. The Government of India knew where the plane was being purchased. The Government of India knew that it was being sought to be airdropped in a part of West Bengal to be used against the legally constituted Government, whoever may be the Government. It is a part of the federal system and is a legally constituted Government. And that was meant to be told to a group who would like to take to arms to destabilise the whole area. Now, how the Ministry of Home had acted on this is my point.

The letter is dated 12th December, 1995. But how was the letter sought to be communicated to the Government of West Bengal. It was sent by a special post. It was not sought to be transmitted through the special fax machine that the Government of India has with the Chief Secretary of the Government of West Bengal. No telephone call was made to follow it up and no person was deputed from the Government of India to discuss with the Government of West Bengal with regard to the possible preparation that should have been made to take a pre-emptive step and forestall the manoeuvring of the foreign powers. It smacks of a serious failure on the part of the Government of India which, in my opinion, is unpardonable. This letter was sent by general post; just by general post it was sent. This letter reached the General Post Office, Calcutta on the 20th December, 1995 and the letter as delivered to the Government of West Bengal on the 26th. Sir, you should kindly remember the warning that we had given to the Department of Telecommunication. While installing high technology, the telecommunication system in its own way has totally disrupted the normal communication channel of the country. It is only the high-tech telephone system that works. The mailing system doesn't work in the country. This is a sad commentary. The inordinate delay in the delivery of the letter is a condemnation by itself of the performance of the Ministry of the Communication, particularly, Mr. Sukh Ram, in this country. I hope that the honourable Home Minister would take note of it. Now, the point is this letter reaches the Government of West Bengal on the 26th December, but the arms were dropped on the 17th December. The Government of India sends a letter on the 12th December, it reaches on the 26th December and the arms were dropped on the 17th December. The honourable Home Minister finds satisfaction because the Government of West Bengal have acted well and there has been a recovery of the arms. Could you tell me if the full consignment of arms that have been dropped were recovered? I say, no. The full consignment could have been recovered if the

Government of West Bengal was informed in time. That is what the Chief Secretary of the Government of West Bengal has written to the Government of India. The letter of the Chief Secretary says, if we were informed in time, perhaps, the entire consignment of arms could have been recovered. Therefore, this delay had resulted in the clandestine dropping of arms to the terrorists.

Who is to be blamed for it? They have been recovered, but partially. How were they recovered? The hon. Home Minister finds satisfaction and that is why I said that it was a spurious statement. The arms were recovered by sheer play of chance which led to the recovery of the arms. There was an accident on that day. People were on the streets. After midnight a number of political elements living in the village, belonging to the Gram Panchayat, grass-root level party activists belonging to the Left parties got hold of a number of AK-47 rifles. What did they do immediately? The grass-root level political activists acted with more alertness than the Minister of the Government of West Bengal. ...(*Interruptions*)... I am sorry. I am correcting it.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY) : He is correcting his statement. Why are you arguing on this?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I should say, let us take the problem in a proper perspective. The point is the Government of India should have acted in a way the political activists working at the grass-root level have acted in West Bengal. That is the simple question (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): I do not want any comments. Kinldy do not interrupt him. Let him speak.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Therefore, the point is, how do you classify this failure? What is the category of this failure? What is the classification? How do you call it? I do not call it treason. I never say it was done deliberately by the Government of India. But it must be classified as an unprecedented failure on the part of the federal Government. Having full knowledge of the conspiracy, it never acted on time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): I think you can now put your questions. You have taken more than 40 minutes.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I am coming to the questions, Sir. I would ask the hon. Minister. Have you been able to find out as to who is the person responsible for the late delivery? If you have been able to find out who is responsible, what action have you taken against him?

Secondly, there is a sensitive question. It is well known to us that the western sector is a sensitive sector. We have our defence preparedness well established there. When the Government of India had the information that a small plane had been purchased and it was being offloaded — and it was being done in Pakistan — how could that plane, on that day, reach here, could penetrate so deep into India? Flying from Karachi, it came to Banaras! It had been able to penetrate deep into the Indian territory. How could it have happened? Therefore, the question is, did you alert the defence system? Having the information, did you activate the defence system? Have you given orders to the other security agencies to be vigilant? If you had given orders, were they obeyed? If they had not been obeyed, then there is a serious lacuna in the system of defence and security in the country which the nation and Parliament cannot overlook.

Sir, I call the statement of the hon. Minister 'curious' because the hon. Minister has held back information from us. I am only sorry to say that the subsequent interrogation of all the people who had been arrested totally confirms —totally confirms the contention of the letter that the Joint Secretary should have passed on to the Government of West Bengal. It clearly confirms that. I come to know, Sir, that in August, 1995, an arms dealer of the United Kingdom, known as Mr. Bleech, was contacted for the supply of 2,500 AK-47 rifles and 50,000 rounds of ammunition. And Mr. Bleech, the arms dealer of the United Kingdom, was told— and the Government of India knew — that the destination was near Calcutta. It was told in clear terms that it was going to be a clandestine delivery. It is in the city of Bangkok, most unfortunately, that the whole conspiracy was given a final shape with Mr. Bleech, the private

dealer of arms, Kim Davy, Randy and Mac. The statement of the hon. Minister of Home Affairs does not refer to Mr. Mac. It is this Mr. Mac who had financed the entire deal. And it is he who had pruchased the parachutes and delivered to Mr. Bleech in the airport of Karachi. Sir, there in Bangkok, Mr. Bleech was given survey maps and slides and all the motable indications of the area where the arms should be dropped. In the course of investigation, it has been found and it is known to the hon. Minister. In between two hillocks, there is a house which could be identified with a headlight which would be put in operation there on that day. And on the hill tops, there would be fire burning. At that point of time, the arms should have been dropped. It is in Bangkok that payments were made. It is in Bangkok that the whole conspiracy was given a thorough rehearsal. Sir, I am sorry to say that the plane which dropped arms at Purulia had a trial run in Vanarasi. The hon. Minister did not agree on a point that there was a trial run before the plan had actually dropped the arms. The plane flew to Vanarasi, stayed there for some time and it was a trial run. And all this time, all the security agencies of the Government of India, under the able leadership of the Prime Minister, who looks after the Defence, were sleeping over all the lapses. Who is to be held responsible?

Finally, we have known something about these people —Randy, Davy and Deepak. They are all vegetarian. They do not smoke. They do not drink. They do not take even coca cola which suggests that they belong to a category of religious-minded terrorist organisation of the country, having international links. After the trial run, the plane went back. It stayed in Karachi for ten days. The passports of these people were never stamped by the Immigration authorities there. We must take a proper lesson from it.

Finally, on 17th the plane took off from Karachi, stayed at Varanasi and after three hours of the stipulated time — the time for dropping the arms was 20 hours but the arms were dropped at 23 hours — because the technical preparation for dropping the arms could not be completed and that was completed on the Indian soil. The final touch to the technical details was given at Varanasi on the Indian soil. Sir, this is the tragedy, this is the tragedy of a colossal dimension. It is not a matter of lapse. It is a matter of serious dereliction of duty. It is a matter of serious failure on the part of each and every security agency of the country, which is headed either by the Home Minister, or by the Prime Minister, or in his capacity as the Defence Minister.

My conclusion is, the arms dropping had an international character. There was an international conspiracy. Secondly, the conspiracy was hatched in foreign countries. Thirdly, the conspirators, perhaps, had the strongest support base in Pakistan. It was financed by some unknown foreign powers in the way the Bombay blast had been financed and in the way the RDX and other explosive had been brought into the country to destabilise the country. They may be the same foreign powers. I do not know. Some unknown foreign powers have financed it.

Finally, the conspirators are connected with mafia groups and religious groups, operating on an international scale, who practise violence and who plead for violence. Therefore, the question that remains to be answered is: "Who is to be held accountable?" In India nobody is found to be accountable. If money is stolen from a bank, the class IV staff is dismissed. If a particular public sector undertaking does not fulfil its commitment towards production, then the workers are penalised. If somebody takes money, the class IV staff is dismissed. Now, there is a serious failure on the part of the Government. Whose head should roll? And should any head roll? My point is: "If some heads should roll, then whose heads should roll?" Sir, the point, therefore, is we cannot gloss over the serious and colossal failure on the part of the governmental agencies saying that we should not take a partisan view.

I hope that the Congress Party Members will take a similar view. There should be a similar volume of indignation among all irrespective of party colours: Whose heads should roll and should any head roll? And if the heads roll, the Government of India must explain, despite having this sensitive information, why it held it back. The Government of India must explain whether, after having the information, the Government of India alerted all the security

agencies of the country, and if the alert was given due weight, whether it is true. Is it true, Sir? Is it true that the radar that had been installed, the defence radar installed near Kharagpur in Kalaikunda ....(*interruption*)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Kindly conclude Gurudas Dasji.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Is it true that the radar was shut down? How is it that you have not been able to find out on the radar screen that an unidentified plane was moving towards Banaras? Thirdly, Sir, will you inquire into why the letter was posted in the normal channel without it being routed through emergency circulation circuit that we have? It is serious; it cannot be overlooked. Therefore, Sir, I plead with you and I plead with the Government, let us break with the past and take some exemplary steps to set right the functioning of the Government, the functioning of the administration, the functioning of the security agencies and the functioning of our defence mechanism and system. It is impossible for us to live with the lapses that are taking place one after another in the Government. Since we have to wait till the results of the next general elections are announced, at least for two months more the Government should come out with its programmes and initiatives to tell the nation that such lapses are not going to be tolerated. I hope that a national approach will be taken with regard to the serious lapse that has taken place so far as the arms-dropping in Purulia is concerned. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, it is almost 2.30. Today, Private Members' Business is listed there. I request that since this is a very serious matter, the Private Members' Business may be taken up at a later date.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Mr. Basu, I had already made an observation; you were not there. At 2 o'clock when the House reassembled, I made that observaton. Shri K.R. Malkani.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI (Delhi): Mr. Chairman, Sir, what happened in purulia on the night of December 17 has shocked the country. It has made us all feel small, that anybody could penetrate this country, play tricks with us and get away! To this day, we do not know. The Government has not taken the people into confidence, as to who have orgnised it and for what. There is even a suspicion that the truth about this incident will never come out. Here I can only quote a few lines from an article by a retired Foreign Secretary of the Government of India, Mr. A.K. Ray. he writes in the Financial Express of 12th January: "Investigating agencies would do well to keep in mind that there is an impression that a gigantic cover-up is on so that no heads roll, no jobs are lost." I hope, our friend Ray is wrong, but we are yet to get an indication from the Government as to what happened, and how and why? Very many questions arise. This plane had sought passage over Indian air-space. It took four hours to fly from Calcutta to Banaras! It takes only three hours to fly from Delhi to Madras. Does it take four hours to fly from Karachi to Banaras? If not, what was this plane doing? Did it play any other games during this period? While first applying for overflight they had not mentioned Calcutta.

It is on second thoughts that they had asked for Calcutta. I wish the DGCA had gone into this matter as to why they are asking for something which they had not asked earlier. The plane took two hours 45 minutes to landed in Calcutta, why? It was supposed to land in Rangoon. The Government of Burma did not allow it to land there. Have you tried to find out from the Government of Burma whether they knew about this thing and why they did not allow it to land there? The plane was supposed to return by the same route via Calcutta and Banaras, back to Karachi. But it landed in Madras. How did the Madras airport allow this plane to land there? They had no initimation from the DGCA that a plane of this kind would land there. My information is that the DGCA in Delhi asked the Madras airport not to allow this plane to take off and the Madras airport authorities said, "Send us written instructions". Before the written instruction, obviously on fax, could reach them, the plane took off. The mischief did not stop there. The Madras airport gave them a health certificate and God knows what other certificate! Why did they do it? Has there been any inquiry into this matter? Fortunately, our Air Force succeeded in forcing the plane to land in Mumbai. The plane landed, and on the

excuse of depositing the fees, a gentleman proceeded to the airport office. A force-landed plane does not have to pay any fees. There has been the airport police. How could this man get away? What are the links of these people? Is it true that three Air Traffic Controllers were suspended, and within a day or two they were reinstated? I would like to know, the whole country would like to know, why. This plane-load of arms landed in Purulia Fortunately, a part of it-nobody knows whether it is half of it or one-third of it or how much-was recovered. The rest was not recovered. I happened to visit Purulia to make an on-the-spot inquiry. Shri Vishnu Kant Shastri and two Members from the Lok Sabha were also with me. Everybody in Bengal told us that these arms must have been meant for certain outfits in Bihar. So, I asked them, "What did you do to stop it? Did you police the border? Did you get helicopters?" The S.P. of Purulia said, "We asked for helicopers." They said that the West Bengal Government told them that they had two helicopers and both of them were under repair. I don't know whether they were under repair or not. The following day when I told this thing to the Press in Calcutta, they laughed. They said, "The two helicopters are very much in shape and they are flying around." I had also asked the S.P., Purulia "If the West Bengal Government helicopers were not available, did you contact the Air Force or the Army?" He said, "We asked and they said that they had to get an okay from the Army Headquaters." They never applied and nobody seemed to have done anything about it. These were a huge packages. Nobody can walk away with it just like that. What was the police doing?

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Mr. Malkani, if you yield for a minute, you please also explain, as you told the Press, how the Anand Margis are being harassed and why they are innocent. That point also you explain.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I will come to the Anand Margis later. Don't be in a hury.

My friend, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, has rightly raised a point that the Government of India wrote a letter by post to the West Bengal Government. Is there no chipher system? Is there no wireless conneciton? It is inexplicable. But one thing is very interesting. The information that the British Intelligence gave to the Government of India was that these arms were to be dropped in Dhanbad. But a check on the plane had shown that the plane had global positioning system which makes for precision landing. So, it is not true that they were to drop the arms in Dhanbad but by mistake they landed them in Purulia. I think there has been some mischief here. Either the informant of the British Intelligence deliberately misled them or the British Intelligence did not convey the correct, the absolutely correct, information to the Government of India.

I think this also is a matter for inquiry as to who played monkey with it. Sir, these arms were dropped on the night of 16th-17th December and the Director-General of Police, West Bengal, went to Purulia only on 22nd December. I wish he had rushed immediately and not lost four days. Things did not end there. He consulted some village chiefs and whoever was around. They said, "Sir, give us four more days and we will try to help you collect the arms." Four more days were given. When we met the DGP, West Bengal, on Dec., 28 he was very frank and candid and honest to tell us that he did not expect any more arms to be collected. On 22nd, it was decided by the DGP that four days will be given to them. It was also announced that there will be a house-to-house search from 27th, on Sir, we were there on 27th. For six hours, we were criss-crossing that area. I did not see a single policeman or a single police jeep. It is possible that our good friend, the hon. Minister of State for Home, was visiting that area and the police force was busy with him. I do not know. But the Government's pledge that a house-to-house search would take place on 27th, did not take place.

Sir, these people stayed in Hotel India in Banaras. Under the rules all hotels are supposed to inform the police about any foreigners staying in their hotels. This particular hotel informed the police about other foreign guests, but they did not mention about these people. This group has been patronising that particular hotel repeatedly. They were not visiting Banaras for the first time. They were familiar with Banaras and some of them can speak Banarasi language. They were very fond of Banarasi *saris*—I do not know for whom. Has this noted man been arrested? If not, why not? My information is,

today only six crew members are in judicial custody, nobody else. Why? These people had agents in Delhi. They had agents in Banaras and possibly they had agents in Calcutta and Madras. How is it that they were taken in and were quickly released on bail? Did the CBI oppose the bail or not? If not, why not?

The only thing, we in this House and the country want to know, is who organised it and for what purpose. This is the main thing. Now the Home Secretary, West Bengal says, "We know who has sent these arms and we know for whom they are meant." A few days later the Minister of State for Home, Shri Sibtey Razi, said, "We know for whom they are meant. But we do not know who the senders are". I hope the hon. Home Minister knows something about it as to who has send these arms and for whom and why. Would he share this information with the country?

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S.B. CHAVAN): Did the Home Secretary say it?

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Yes, it has come in the Press.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: For whom these arms were meant, are they aware of it?

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: He said, "We know who has sent these arms and for whom."

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: That is the point. Did he say that?

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Yes, he said it.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: I will be very happy if they pass on this information to me.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: There is another thing which is very funny. I will not call it funny. It is a very sad thing. My friend, Shri Gurudas Das Gupta has referred to Anand Margis. I know next to nothing about Anand Margis. Some years back I tried to read their literature. I did not find that either readable or intelligible. So I left it at that. All kinds of odd and award things happen in this country. They can happen anywhere.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: You said that the Government was harassing them ...(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I have taken note of your point and I will deal with it. Now, if you ask the CBI officers in confidence, they will say that it was the Anand Margis. If that is so, please hang them. Do whatever you want to do with them. But I have a newspaper cutting before me. It is a cutting from the *Pioneer* of the 5th March. It says, "The Union Home Secretary Shri K. Padmanabhaiah told the Pioneer that the Government had no doubt...."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): Don't quote a newspaper. This is a convention in the House. If you want to say something, you can say it.

SHRI K. R. MALKANI: Mr. Padmanabhaiah, the Home Secretary, said that the Government was convinced that the Anand Margis had nothing to do with it.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: He has contradicted it...(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I wish we could carry on with this argument as adults. If he has contradicted it, then it is fine. We will be happy. But I have not come across that statement.

I repeat that if the Anand Margis are involved in it, you should take action against them. You can do what you like with them. But from day one, even before the CBI or anybody else could came on the scene, our Communist friends have been saying that it is the Anand Margis doing. Maybe, they knew about it. I don't know. But they started saying this even before anybody could inquire into the matter. some people were arrested and within two days they were released on bail. The Anand Margis have even threatened to sue the West Bengal Government.

[The Deputy Chairman *in the Chair*.]

If the Anand Margis were involved in it, then a small question will arise. Why did the Government wait for 2½ months to raid their offices. If there was anything to hide, it would have dissappeared. I have a suspicion that certain agencies, certain elements are trying to hurt India. Probably, they have taken cover under the guise of some religious organisation. Just think of this. The arms have come from Bulgaria. The crew comes from Latvia. The parachutes comes from South Africa. The plane comes from Hong Kong. Who could have organised campaigns of this kind? I do not want to say anything more. But the needle of

suspicion points in a certain direction. I hope the Government will inquire in that direction. Our good friend, Shri Gurudas Das Gupta, said that the Anand Margis wanted Hindu Raj in India. This is news to me. The Anand Margis never use the word Hindu or Hindutva. They live in a world of their own.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: I am really impressed by your selective knowledge of the Anand Margis.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him complete his speech. We have got very little time.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I have a suspicion. I think it is an international conspiracy.

Only a day before these arms were dropped, the *New York Times* had come out with a news item that India was going to have a nuclear explosion. Were they trying to divert our attention?

I think that is possible. It may be just a coincidence. But I am not prepared to dismiss it as pointless...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We will have to finish it by 5 O'clock.... (*Interruptions*) I have got many names. So, you put your questions.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I have already put my questions.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, you can sit down.

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी (उत्तर प्रदेश): अभी तो शुरू किया है।

THE DEUTY CHAIRMAN: We should have finished it in one hour.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I will take half-a-minute more.

There are all kinds of outfits in Bihar; I do not know. Our good frined, Shri Jagannath Mishra, can throw some light on it. They call themselves MCC, the Maoist Communist Committee. God knows who they are and what they are. I am sure that they have nothing to do with the CPI (M) as such. All kinds of mischievous outfits with mysterious links and mysterious sources are working in India to destabilise India. I hope that the hon. Home Minister will throw light on some of these things because the whole country is worried and anxious to know all that is happening. He said that nothing like this has happened before. It is possible that such a thing happened but the Government or the country has not come to know about it. This came to light because the arms were dropped at a point where the people were protesting about a vehicle running over a child. That is why the people were alert in that area. Otherwise, it is possible that all these things would have disappeared. I remember that in the early days of independence, there used to be regular flying of arms from Karachi to Hyderabad. So, it is possible that such things have been happening. But it is good that at least for once we found it. I hope that the Government will throw some light on these issues.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Md. Salim. Mr. Salim, I would be very thankful if you put questions.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Madam, so many points have been raised. क्वैश्चन तो बहुत से हैं और मैं क्वैश्चन करुंगा तो ज्यादा बोलना हो जाएगा। हम लोगों ने करीब दो महीने, तीन महीने इंतजार किया कि सरकार के पास से हिंदुस्तान के लोगों को मालूम हो सके कि आखिर हो क्या रहा है। यह दूसरा मौका है, जब हम सरकार के किसी मंत्री के पास से कुछ मालूम कर सके हैं, आफिशियली। पहला मौका तो था परसों के रोज, जब इसी हाऊस में मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट, जूनियर जो मंत्री थे, उन्होंने जवाब दिया हमारे एक साथी के प्रश्न के उत्तर में। सरकार खुद कह रही है स्टेटमेंट में, कि आजादी के बाद ऐसा मामला पहला हुआ। यह बहुत गंभीर है।

मैडम, यह हमारे मुल्क के लिए एक बहुत बड़ी ट्रेजडी है। पूरी दुनियां के लोग तो हंसेंगे हमारे ऊपर कि हम इतना बड़ा मुल्क होकर गौरव करते हैं अपने ऊपर, लेकिन यह क्या हुआ? दिसंबर की अंधेरी रात में जहाज पूरा परफेक्ट ट्रेलर की तरह .....(व्यवधान).....

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम (पश्चिम बंगाल): क्वेश्चन तो बहुत से हैं-और मैं क्वेश्चन करूंगा तो ज़्यादा बोलना हो जाएगा-हम लोगों ने करीब दो महीने इंतज़ार किया कि सरकार के पास से हिन्दुस्तान के लोगों को मालूम हो सके कि आखिर क्या हो रहा है-यह दूसरा मौका है-

†جب ہم سرکار کے کسی منتری کے پاس سے کچھ معلوم کر سکتے ہیں آفیشیلی - پہلا موقع تو تقاپرسوں کے روز - جب اسی ہاؤس میں منسٹر آف اسٹیٹ جو نیئر منتری جو تھے انھوں نے جواب دیا تھا ہمارے ایک ساتھی کے پرشن کے اتر میں - سرکار خود کہہ رہی ہے اسٹیٹمنٹ میں کہ آزادی کے بعد ایسا معاملہ پہلا ہوا ہے - یہ بہت گمبھیر ہے - میڈم - یہ ہمارے ملک کیلئے ایک بہت بڑی ٹریجڈی ہے - پوری دنیا کے لوگ تو ھنسینگے ھمارے اوپر کہ ہم اتنا بڑا ملک ہو کر گورو کرتے ہیں اپنے اوپر لیکن یہ کیا ہوا - دسمبر کی اندھیری رات میں ہماری جہاز پورا پرفیکٹ ٹریکری کے - ...مداخلت"...]

They are not bothered about the country's security. They are busy about the security of their seats.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Ministers are laughing away the lapses.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody is laughing. जिस मिनिस्टर को सुनना चाहिए, वह तो सुन रहे हैं। .....(व्यवधान)..... अब जो मंत्री सुन रहे हैं उनको तो सुनने दीजिए। ..... (व्यवधान) .....

श्री गुरुदास दासगुप्त: जिनको नहीं नहीं सुनना, बात करना है, मेहरबानी करके बाहर जाकर बात करें। ..... (व्यवधान).....

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु: मैडम, ट्रेजरी बैंचेज का यह हाल है तो सिक्योरिटी के बारे में क्या होगा? ट्रेजरी बैंचेज आप देख लीजिए। .....(व्यवधान).....

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: वह सुनें या न सुनें, उनके तो सुनने का ही समय ज्यादा नहीं है, करने का समय खतम हो गया है। लेकिन, हमारे देश के लोगों को मालूम होना चाहिए कि देश की हिफाजत .....(व्यवधान).....

†اشری محمد سلیم: وہ سنیں یا نہ سنیں اتنے تو سننے کا ہی سمے سے زیادہ نہیں ہے کرنے کا سمے ختم ہو گیا ہے - لیکن ہمارے دیش کے لوگوں کو معلوم ہونا چاہئے کہ دیش کی حفاظت ...مداخلت"...]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is a question of the country. If the arms were dropped in Purulia, then Bihar is not far away, Assam is not far away. So, you be serious and listen.

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: मैडम, यह 95 करोड़ के मुल्क में हम रात को सोते हैं इत्मीनान से कि यह डिफैन्स मिनिस्ट्री है, होम मिनिस्ट्री है। .....(व्यवधान)..... मजाक की बात नहीं है। .....(व्यवधान).....

†اشری محمد سلیم: میڈم یہ 95 کروڑ کے ملک میں ہم رات کو سوتے ہیں - اطمنان سے کہ یہ ڈیفینس منسٹری ہے - ھوم منسٹری ہے - ...مداخلت"... مذاق کی بات نہیں ہے - ...مداخلت"...]

उपसभापति: उनका चेहरा ही हंसता हुआ है, क्या करें? .....(व्यवधान).....

If somebody's face is smiling, you can't ask him to frown all the time.

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: मैडम, लोग हमारे ऊपर हंसेंगे। .....(व्यवधान)..... मिश्र जी, हमारे ऊपर लोगों की परेशानी लेकर हंसी करवाते हैं। देश के 95 करोड़ लोग आपको गद्दी पर बैठाकर इत्मीनान से सोना चाहते थे और 17 दिसंबर की रात को मालूम हुआ कि इतनी निकम्मी आपकी सरकार है, रक्षा मंत्रालय है, होम मिनिस्ट्री है, आपका इंटेलीजेन्स है।

†اشری محمد سلیم: میڈم لوگ ہمارے اوپر ھنسینگے - ...مداخلت"... منتر جی - ہمارے اوپر لوگوں کی پریشانی لیکر ھنسی کروا تے ہیں - دیش کے 95 کروڑ لوگ آپکو گدی پر بیٹھا کر اطمینان سے سونا

† Transliteration in Arabic Script

چاہتے ہیں۔ اور 7 دسمبر کی رات کو معلوم ہوا کہ اتنی فلمی آپکی سرکار ہے سرکشنا منترالیہ ہے ہوم منسٹری ہے آپکا انٹیلیجنس ہے۔]

कि कुछ भी कर ले, पूरी दुनिया को यह मैसेज पहुंचा है कि इस धरती पर आकर, कोई से आकर, दुनिया के किसी भी हिस्से से आकर, कुछ भी करके जा सकता है और न तो आप पहले से कुछ जान सकते हैं, जानने से कुछ कर सकते हैं और न जानने के बाद आप कुछ कर सकते हैं। हंसने के अलावा आप क्या करेंगे? आने वाली सदी और जाने वाली पीढ़ी आप पर हंसेगी। ..... (व्यवधान).....

†[شری محمد سلیم بھاری]: کہ کچھ بھی کرلے۔ پوری دنیا کو یہ میسیج پہنچا ہے کہ اس دھرتی پر آکر۔ کوئی بھی کہیں سے آکر۔ دنیا کے کسی حصے سے آکر۔ کچھ بھی کرکے جا سکتا ہے۔ اور نہ تو آپ پہلے کچھ جان سکتے ہیں اور نہ جاننے کے بعد کچھ کر سکتے ہیں۔ ہنسنے کے علاوہ آپ کیا کریں گے آنے والی صدی اور آنے والی پیڑھی آپ پر ہنسیگی۔ ... "مداخلت" ...]

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The State Government is also responsible.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't make it an issue between the Centre and the State.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, the Central Government and the State Government are very concerned about the incident. It is not that the Central Government alone should be concerned ...(*interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, I have name also. You say when your turn comes. I know you are very much concerned. Everybody is concerned. Now let us go-ahead.

† Transliteration in Arabic Script

श्री माहम्मद सलीम: अरे, यह सैंट्रल गवर्नमैंट या स्टेट गवर्नमैंट का मामला नहीं है। जब गवर्नमैंट नहीं थी इस देश में उसके बावजूद भी यहां पर देश था, लोग थे और सभ्यता थी और जब सरकार का कोई नाम नहीं रहेगा, उसके बाद भी लोग रहेंगे, लेकिन किस हालत में रहेंगे वह सवाल पूछ रहा हूं और जो जिम्मेदारी है आपकी, वह आप निभा रहे हैं या नहीं निभा रहे हैं। सैंट्रल गवर्नमैंट और स्टेट गवर्नमैंट की बात करते है।

और वही सवाल-जवाब दिए हैं। मैं वहां से शरू करूंगा जहां से इनके प्रश्न का उत्तर आया है। 6 तारीख को मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट कह रहे है, कितने सीरियस है ये लोग कि:-

†[شری محمد سلیم بھاری]: ارے یہ سینٹرل گورنمنٹ یا اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ کا معاملہ نہیں ہے۔ جب گورنمنٹ نہیں تھی اس دیش میں اسکے باوجود یہاں پردیش تھا۔ لوگ تھے اور سبھیتا تھی اور جب سرکار کا کوئی نام نہ رہیگا۔ اسکے بعد بھی لوگ رہینگے۔ لیکن کس حالت میں رہینگے۔ وہ سوال پوچھ رہا ہوں۔ اور ذمہ داری ہے آپکی۔ وہ آپ نبھا رہے ہیں۔ یا نہیں نبھا رہے ہیں سینٹرل گورنمنٹ اور اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ کی بات کرتے ہیں۔

جو سوال جواب دیئے ہیں میں وہاں سے شروع کرونگا جہاں سے اسکے پرشن کا اتر آیا ہے 6 تاریخ کو منسٹر آف اسٹیٹ کہہ رہے ہیں کتنے سیریس ہیں یہ لوگ کہ۔ ...]

"...the intelligence agencies had prior information about the possibility of arms being unloaded by a small plane after landing at an abadoned place in Dhanbad area of Bihar, for an insurgent group of that area... The Government of Bihar was sensitised by the concerned intelligence agence...".

इनका इंटेलिजेंस लेवल इतने तक है कि धनबाद एरिया में अगर भेजा जाता है औजार, ब्रिटिश से खबर आती है और धनबाद से पुरुलिया या धनबाद और बंगाल के बार्डर में कितना अंतर है, यह इनके दिमाग में समझ में नहीं आएगा। वह स्टेट गवर्नमेंट और सैंट्रल गवर्नमेंट की बात कर रहे हैं और बिहार गवर्नमेंट को वह बता दिए।

†[انکا انٹیلیجینس لیول اتنے تک ہے کہ دھنباد ایریا میں اگر بھیجا جاتا ہے اوزار برٹش سے خبر آتی ہے - اور دھنباد سے پرولیا اور دھنباد اور بنگال کے بارڈر میں کتنا انتر ہے یہ انکے دماغ میں سمجھ میں نہیں آئیگا - وہ اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ اور سینٹرل گورنمنٹ کی بات کر رہے ہیں - اور یہاں گورنمنٹ کو وہ بتا دیئے]

"...The information was also shared with the West Bengal Government as a matter of additional precaution..."

हम इन्हें धन्यवाद करते हैं, बधाई देते हैं कि इनकी समझ में यह भी आ गया कि एडीशनल प्रिकाशन्स के लिए बंगाल की सरकार को भी बोलना चाहिए और मैं उस बात में नहीं जाऊंगा, इस पर काफी बहस हो गई, गुरुदास जी ने बता दिया कि किस तरह बताना चाहिए। जब हम मॉडर्न ऐज में जा रहे हैं, सैलुलर फोन की बात कर रहे हैं, फैक्स की बात कर रहे हैं, अरे, चीफ मिनिस्टर को बुला लेते दिल्ली में। जब मणिपुर में आपके एम०एल०ए० छोटी-मोटी गड़बड़ करते हैं विद इन पार्टी, मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट फार होम अफेयर्स प्राइवेट पार्टी के टूर के लिए एयर फोर्स के प्लेन को लेकर मणिपुर जा सकते हैं, पार्टी के अंदरुनी झगड़े को निबटाने के लिए, तो इस देश की सुरक्षा के लिए आप एक अफसर को बी. एस.एफ. का प्लेन लेकर नहीं भेज सकते थे? बुला लेते, नहीं बुलाया है।

ہم انہیں دھنیہ واد کرتے ہیں بدھائی دیتے ہیں کہ انکی سمجھ میں یہ بھی آگیا کہ ایڈیشنل پری کاشنس کیلئے بنگال کی سرکار بھی بولنا چاہیئے - اور میں اس بات میں نہیں جاؤنگا اس پر کافی بحث ہو گئی ہے - گرو داس جی نے بتا دیا کہ کس طرح بتانا چاہیئے - جب ہم ماڈرن ایج میں جا رہے ہیں سیلولر فون کی بات کر رہے ہیں فیکس کی بات کر رہے ہیں ارے چیف منسٹر کو بلا لیتے دلی میں - جب منی پور میں آپکے ایم - ایل - اے - چھوٹی موٹی گڑبڑ کرتے ہیں وہاں پارٹی منسٹر آف اسٹیٹ فار ہوم افیرس پرائیویٹ پارٹی کے ٹور کے لئے ایئر فورس کی پلین لیکر منی پور جا سکتے ہیں - پارٹی کے اندرونی جھگڑے نپٹانے کیلئے - تو اس دیش کی سرکشا کیلئے آپ ایک افسر کو بی - ایس - ایف - کا پلین لیکر نہیں بھیج سکتے تھے - بلا لیتے نہیں بلایا ہے]

"...the letters containing the information being of classified nature were disbursed as per the existing instructions on the subject.

इससे अच्छा ब्यूरोक्रेटिक जवाब हो नहीं सकता। लेकिन सवाल है कि यह एग्जिस्टिंग इंस्ट्रक्शन किसने दिया? कहां से आया? कोई रुल वगैरह कुछ है? सैंट्रल गवर्नमेंट से स्टेट गवर्नमेंट से? जब इस नेचर के बाहर से हथियार प्रिक्योर हो रहे हैं, इट वुड बी केरिड, गिराया जाएगा, स्पेसिफिक इन्फारमेशन है, स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को आप देंगे? मैं गलत शब्द इस्तेमाल नहीं करूंगा लेकिन अक्लमंद का या अक्ल का यह फेर है कि इंस्ट्रक्शन दिया है और क्लासीफाइड किए हैं कि इसको रजिस्टर्ड पोस्ट में भेजना पड़ेगा और इसके अलावा किसी सूरत से किसी को मालूम नहीं होना चाहिए। खैर, हम अक्लमंद होते हैं मामला हो जाने के बाद। तो सरकार अब बहुत चौकन्नी हो गई है और मंत्री जी की रिपोर्ट में है कि इसको स्ट्रैथन करने के लिए, बेटर को-आर्डिनेशन करने के लिए उन्होंने अभी बहुत से एक्दामात उठाए हैं। कमेटी बनाई थी, उसने एक रिपोर्ट दी और सरकार ने उसे मान लिया। यह

† Transliteration in Arabic Script

हर मामला होने के बाद एक कमेटी बनाते हैं और सरकार कहती है कि अब तक हम जो-जो यत्न किए है, जो-जो स्टेप्स दिए हैं, इसके बाद फूल-प्रूफ अरेंजमेंट करने की हम कोशिश कर रहे हैं कि दोबारा ऐसा वाक्या न हो।

मैडम, पहला सवाल है कि सरकार की जो रिपोर्ट सरकार के पास थी, इसके बारे में होम मिनिस्टर साहब ने अपनी स्टेटमेंट में शायद कुछ भी ज़िक्र नहीं किया है। शुरू होता है स्टेटमेंट दिसम्बर 17 से, ...

†मंत्री महोदय "जारी" इस से अच्छा बयान तो शायद कोई जवाब हो नहीं सकता। लेकिन सवाल है कि ब्लैक मेलिंग इन्फरमेशन किस ने दिया। कहां से आया। कोई रोल वगैरह कुछ है। सेन्ट्रल गवर्नमेंट से स्टेट गवर्नमेंट से। जब इस सदन के बाहर से महत्वपूर्ण पेपर्स लीक हो रहे हैं "इट वुड बी केयरलेस" गिराया जाएगा। सिक्योरिटी एक्सपर्ट कहते हैं। स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को आप देंगे। मैं गलत शब्द इस्तेमाल नहीं करूंगा। लेकिन अक्लमंद का या अक्ल का ये फेर है कि इन्फरमेशन दिया है और कहा सिक्योरिटी के लिए है कि इसको रजिस्टर्ड पोस्ट में भेजना पड़ेगा और इसके अलावा किसी सूरत से किसी को मालूम होना चाहिए। खैर हम अक्लमंद होते हैं मामला हो जाने के बाद। तो सरकार अब बहुत चौकन्नी हो गई है। और मंत्री जी की रिपोर्ट में है कि इसको इन्टरप्रेट करने के लिए। पेपर को आर्डी नेशन करने के लिए उन्होंने अभी बहुत से

† Transliteration in Arabic Script

اقدامات اٹھائے ہیں۔ کمیٹی بنائی تھی۔ اس نے ایک رپورٹ دی اور سرکار نے اسے مان لیا۔ یہ ہر معاملہ ہونے کے بعد ایک کمیٹی بناتے ہیں اور سرکار کہتی ہے کہ اب تک ہم جو جو یتن کئے ہیں جو جو اسٹیپس دیئے ہیں اسکے بعد فول پروف ارینجمنٹ کرنے کی ہم کوشش کر رہے ہیں کہ دوبارہ ایسا واقعہ نہ ہو۔

میڈم - پہلا سوال ہے کہ سرکار کی جو رپورٹ سرکار کے پاس تھی اسکے بارے میں ہوم منسٹر صاحب نے اپنی اسٹیٹمنٹ میں شاید کچھ بھی ذکر نہیں کیا ہے۔ شروع ہوتا ہے اسٹیٹمنٹ 17 دسمبر سے .....]

जो बयान उन्होंने दिया, जो लोग अखबार पढ़ते हैं और पेपर क्लिपिंग्ज़ रखते हैं तो होम-मिनिस्ट्री की जरूरत नहीं है हमारे मुल्क में और पार्लियामेंट की जरूरत भी आहिस्ता-आहिस्ता खत्म हो जाती है। हम डिमांड कर रहे हैं कि सरकार जनता के साथ शेयर करे इन्फारमेशन, स्टेट-गवर्नमेंट के साथ शेयर करे इन्फारमेशन। पार्लियामेंट के जरिए मैसेज दे। अगर गलत मैसेज आप पहले दे चुके हैं तो पूरी दुनिया को दे कि this Government means business.

महोदया, हिंदुस्तान के लोग कम से कम थोड़े चौकन्ने हुए हैं और ऐसे हालात हम बरदाश्त नहीं करेंगे कि कोई भी कहीं से भी आ जाए बैंकाक, थाईलैंड से और इंटरनेशनल कांस्पिरेसी करके हथियार फेंककर चला जाए। लेकिन वह नहीं हुआ और यह मैसेज नहीं गया यहां से कहीं भी। वाक्या होने के बाद क्या-क्या आपने किया, यह बयान उसके बारे में है।

महोदया, मैं दो-तीन बातें आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूं। पहला सवाल आता है 17 दिसंबर से पहले का। एक तो इंटेलिजेंस पार्ट है। महोदया, यह जो ए.एन. 26 को

परमीशन दी गई, देने वाला कौन है? परमीशन दी डी.जी. सी.ए. ने। हमने फैडरल स्ट्रक्चर की गवर्नमैंट बनाई है और कम्युनिकेशन, सिविल ऐवियेशन, डिफैंस आदि हमने दे दिया है सैंट्रल गवर्नमैंट के हाथ में। हमारी स्टेट से सैंट्रल गवर्नमैंट के बीच कम्युनिकेशन की क्या हालत है, वह इससे मालूम होता है जब वाक्या होने के बाद खत पहुंचता है। सैंट्रल गवर्नमैंट का परफारमैंस बताता है यह। पोस्टल अरैंजमैंट क्या है?

दूसरा सवाल यह है कि आपने परमीशन दी तो स्टेट गवर्नमैंट आती नहीं पिक्चर में। सैंट्रल गवर्नमैंट को इंटेलिजैंस की रिपोर्ट मिली कि एक छोटा सा प्लेन विदेश से आएगा हथियार लेकर, धनबाद में डालने के लिए और आपका दूसरा एक विंग है डी.जी.सी.ए., सिविल ऐवियेशन के अंतर्गत, वह परमीशन देते हैं तो क्या आपने शेयर किया आपस में? आप इधर दिल्ली में बैठे हुए जो लोग हैं। उनका कोआर्डिनेशन क्या हो रहा है? डिफैंस मिनिस्ट्री, होम मिनिस्ट्री, इंटेलिजैंस, ये जितनी एजैंसीज़ हैं, क्या करते हैं आप लोग? डी॰जी॰सी॰ए॰ ने परमीशन कैसे दे दी? महोदया, सरकार की रिपोर्ट के अनुसार यहां स्टेटमैंट है कि बंगाल गवर्नमैंट ने पकड़ा। जो ऐजैंसी है, जिन्होंने परमीशन प्राप्त की थी, एयर चार्टर्ड सर्विस इंडिया के जे॰के॰ मल्हान और एस॰के॰ मल्हान को बंगाल गवर्नमैंट ने अरेस्ट किया। दूसरी बात यह है कि इंटेलिजैंस रिपोर्ट आने के बाद हम जानते हैं कि हमारा काऊंटर-इंटेलिजैंस भी होना चाहिए। कराची में प्लेन ठहर गया, वहां लकड़ी के बक्से बने, हथियार रि-पैक हुए। I am referring to your statement.

हथियार रि-पैक हुए कन्वीनियैंटली झांप करने के लिए और हमारा काऊंटर-इंटेलिजैंस कुछ है क्या? जिस प्लेन को आपने कराची से उड़ने के लिए परमीशन दी, वह प्लेन वहां हफ्ते भर से ठहरा हुआ है और क्या कर रहा है, कोई ,खबर नहीं है हमारे पास। जो मुल्क की खबर नहीं रखते, वे मुल्क के बाहर की खबर कैसे रखेंगे?

महोदया, कोई भी विदेश से जो फ्लाइट आती है और यदि वह ऐनिमी कंट्री हो, हम पाकिस्तान को दुश्मन नहीं मानते लेकिन दुश्मनी की फिजां बन गई है, हालत ऐसी है, इसलिए जो रुटीन फ्लाईट है, उसका भी सर्विलियैंस करना चाहिए। अगर पाकिस्तान इंटरनेशनल एयरलाइंस का कोई प्लेन फ्लाई करता है तो देखना चाहिए कि कहां जा रहा है, जितनी हाईट से जाना चाहिए था, उतनी हाईट से जा रहा है कि नहीं जा रहा है। हमने वह कुछ नहीं किया। बनारस में प्लेन आया, ठहर गया, हमने कुछ नहीं किया। कलकत्ते में पहुंचा रंगून जाने के बजाय, बर्मा गवर्नमैंट जिसे परमीशन नहीं देती है, हम उसे परमीशन देते हैं। अभी तक स्टेट गवर्नमैंट पिक्चर में नहीं है। स्टेट के लोग भी नहीं हैं।

उपसभापति: अब जरा जल्दी-जल्दी कर दीजिए। आप जरा बड़ा प्लेन उड़ा दीजिए ताकि सब बोल सकें। आप धीरे-धीरे प्लेन रुकाते जा रहे हैं तो कितना टाईम लगेगा। कितने ही लोग बोलने वाले हैं।

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: लोग हमें पूछते हैं आप लोग पार्लियामैंट में जाकर झख मारते हो? ऐसे-ऐसे मंत्री बनाकर बिठाए हो?

†[श्री मोहम्मद सलीम जारी]: जो उन्होंने किया उन्होंने दिया-जो लोग अखबार पढ़ते हैं और पेपर क्लिपिंग रखते हैं-तो हम हर मिनिस्ट्री की जरूरत नहीं है हमारे मुल्क में और पार्लियामैंट की जरूरत भी आहिस्ता आहिस्ता खत्म हो जाती है-हम ये महसूस कर रहे हैं कि सरकार जितने के साथ शेयर करे एग्जीक्यूशन एसेंबली को गवर्नमैंट के साथ शेयर करे एग्जीक्यूशन पार्लियामैंट के जरिये मैसेज दे-अगर गलत मैसेज आप पहले दे चुके हैं तो पूरी दुनिया को दें कि-

this Government means business.

†महोदया-हिन्दुस्तान के लोग कम से कम थोड़े से जुड़े हुए हैं-और ऐसे हालात हम बर्दाश्त नहीं करेंगे-कि कोई भी कहीं से भी आ जाए-बंगाल, थाईलैंड से और इंटरनेशनल कानसपिरेसी करके हथियार पैनिट्रेट करके चला जाए-लेकिन वह नहीं हुआ और

†[] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

یہ مسیج نہیں گیا یہاں سے کہیں بھی۔ واقعہ ہونے کے بعد کیا کیا آپنے کیا۔ یہ بیان اسکے بارے میں ہے۔

مہودیہ۔ میں دو تین باتیں آپکے سامنے رکھنا چاہتا ہوں پہلا سوال آتا ہے ۱۷ دسمبر سے پہلے کا۔ ایک تو انٹیلیجنس پارٹ ہے۔ مہودیہ۔ یہ جو اے این۔ ۲۶ کو پرمیشن دی گئی دینے والا کون۔ پرمیشن دی۔ ڈی۔ جی۔ سی۔ اے نے ہم نے فیڈرل اسٹرکچر کی گورنمنٹ بنائی ہے اور کمیونیکیشن۔ سول ایویئیشن ڈیفنس آدی ہم نے دے دیا ہے سینٹرل گورنمنٹ کے ہاتھ میں۔ ہماری اسٹیٹ سے سینٹرل گورنمنٹ سے بیچ کمیونیکیشن کی کیا حالت ہے۔ وہ اس سے معلوم ہوتا ہے۔ جب واقعہ ہونے کے بعد خط پہونچتا ہے۔ یہ سینٹرل گورنمنٹ کا پرفارمینس بنتا ہے۔ پوسٹل ارینجمنٹ کیا ہے۔

دوسرا سوال یہ ہے کہ آپنے پرمیشن دی تو اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ آئی نہیں پکچر میں۔ سینٹرل گورنمنٹ کو انٹیلیجنس کی رپورٹ ملی کہ ایک چھوٹا سا پلین وديش سے آئیگا۔ ھتیار لیکر۔ دھنباد میں ڈالنے کیلئے اور آ بھاگا دوسرا ایک ونگ ہے ڈی۔ جی۔ سی۔ اے۔ سول ایویئیشن کے اختیار میں۔ وہ پرمیشن دیتے ہیں تو کیا اپنے شیئر کیا آپس میں؟

آپ ادھر دلی میں بیٹھے ہوئے جھارکھنڈ میں انکا کوآرڈینیشن کیا ہو رہا ہے۔ ڈیفینس منسٹر۔ ھوم منسٹر۔ انٹیلیجنس یہ جتنی ایجنسیز ہیں کیا کرتے ہیں آپ روک۔ ڈی۔ جی۔ سی۔ اے۔ نے پرمیشن کیسے دیدی۔

مہودیہ۔ سرکار کسی رپورٹ کے انوسار یہاں اسیسمنٹ ہے کہ بنگال گورنمنٹ نے بلکہ ا۔ جو ایجنسی ہے جنہوں نے پرمیشن پراپت کی تھی۔ ایئر چارٹرڈ سروس انڈیا کے۔ جے کے۔ ملہان اور ایس۔ کے۔ ملہان کو بنگال گورنمنٹ نے اویسٹ کیا۔ دوسری بات یہ ہے کہ انٹیلیجنس رپورٹ آنے کے بعد ہم جانتے ہیں کہ ہمارا کاؤنٹر انٹیلیجنس بھی ہونا چاہیئے۔ کراچی میں پلین ٹھہر گیا وہاں لکڑی کے بکسس بنے۔ ھتیار دی پیک ہوئے۔

I am referring to your statement.

ھتیار دی پیک ہوئے۔ کنونینشنل ڈراپ کرنے کیلئے۔ اور ہمارا کاؤنٹر انٹیلیجنس کچھ ہے کیا۔ جس پلین کو اپنے کراچی سے اڑنے کیلئے پرمیشن دی۔

وہ پلین وہاں پہنچے بعد سے ٹھہرا ہوا
اور کیا کر رہا ہے - کوئی خبر نہیں ہے ہمارے
پاس - جو ملک کی خبر نہیں رکھتے - وہ
ملک کے باہر کی خبر کیسے رکھیں گے -

مہودیہ - کوئی بھی وہ دیش سے فلائٹ
سے فلائٹ آئی ہے - اور یہ ری وہ اینی
کنڑی ہو - ہم پاکستان کو دشمن نہیں
مانتے لیکن دشمنی کی فضا بن گئی ہے حالت
ایسی ہے اسلئے جو روٹین فلائٹ ہے -
اسکا بھی سرویلینس کرنا چاہیئے - اگر
پاکستان انٹرنیشنل ایئر لائنس کا کوئی
پلین فلائی کرتا ہے تو دیکھنا چاہیئے کہاں
جا رہا ہے - جتنی صائٹ سے جانا چاہیئے
تھا - اتنی صائٹ سے جا رہا ہے - کہ نہیں
جا رہا ہے - ہم نے وہ چیک نہیں کیا - بنارس
میں پلین آیا - ٹھہر گیا - ہم نے چیک نہیں
کیا کلکتے میں پھر نیا رنگون جانے کے
بجائے - برما گورنمنٹ جسے پرمیشن نہیں
دیتی ہے - ہم اسے پرمیشن دیتے ہیں - ابھی
تک اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ پکچر میں نہیں ہے -
اسٹیٹ کے روگ بھی نہیں ہیں -

اب سمجھا پتی - جلدی جلدی کر دیجئے
آپ ذرا بڑا پلین اڑا دیجئے - تاکہ سب
چل سکیں - آپ دھیرے دھیرے پلین

رکھتے جا رہے ہیں تو کتنا ٹائم لگیگا - کتنے
ہی لوگ بولنے والے ہیں -

شری محمد سلیم: لوگ ہمیں پوچھتے ہیں
آپ لوگ پارلیمنٹ کے اندر جا کر چیک
ہیں - ایسے ایسے منتری بنا کر بھاگے ہوتا

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salim, all those people who have given their names, they also want to speak.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sure.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, they also have a right.

SHRI MD. SALIM: That is why we have foregone....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: People will put questions to them also.

SHRI MD. SALIM: That is why we also skipped the Private Members' business. We were prepared to skip even the lunch and the Friday prayers because the issue of Purulia is a very serious one.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Go ahead.

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: तो यहां पर जो है, तो एक तो है सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट, दूसरा है--स्टेट गवर्नमेंट-बिहार और बंगाल। सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट का मतलब हमने बताया कि जो दूसरे डिपार्टमेंट है--डी॰जी॰सी॰ए॰ और डिफेंस वगैरह। तीसरा, वह है कांस्पेरेटर। मैं उसमें नहीं जाऊंगा। मलकानी जी कहेंगे, गुरूदास जी कुछ कहेंगे। मैं उस पर बाद में आऊंगा। सरकार की रिपोर्ट से मैं कह रहा हूं। चूंकि आप बोलेंगे कि बंगाल की गवर्नमेंट दुश्मनी से किसी को बोल सकती है, हम बंगाल के लोग किसी को बोल सकते हैं। लेकिन एक बहुत बड़ा नेटवर्क इसमें काम किया है, यह बात तो सही है। आपको ईसीडेंटली रिपोर्ट मिल गई थी, उसके बावजूद भी यह जो कांस्पेरेटर्स हैं। इससे पता चला कि इंटरनेशनल लेविल की कास्पेरेसी है, फिर भी आपने कुछ नहीं किया। किसने किया फिर? मैडम्, यहां पर और भी किरायेदार है। वह है पुरूलिया के आधे नंगे, आधे भूखे गांव के लोग। सरकार के डिफेंस के लिए हम खर्च करते हैं, पुलिस रखते हैं, बहुत कुछ रखते हैं। हमारे इस मुल्क में आर्म्स॰एक्स॰ लाया जाता है, तो कस्टम से लेकर, पुलिस से लेकर, कोस्टल गार्ड से लेकर के बोर्डर के बाद तस्करी होता है तथा बी॰एस॰एफ॰ के पर्सोनल

कुछ लेकर के उसके बावजूद भी हमारे मुल्क में आता है। जब वह औजार फैंके गए तो गांव के लोग उसको लेकर के यह खबर देते है। तो इस मुल्क की हिफाजत यह हुकूमत नहीं कर सकती। नारायणसामी जी जो गवर्नमैंट को लेकर बहस कर रहे है वह गवर्नमैंट हिफाजत नहीं कर सकती। अगर हिफाजत करने वाले हैं तो वे लोग हैं जो गरीब, लोग हैं, गरीब जनता है। उनमें कम से कम इतनी चेतना थी कि इसके बारे में हम जाकर खबर दे दें। परन्तु जब आर॰डी॰एक्स॰ के बारे में कस्टम आफिसर को मालूम हो जाता है फिर भी वह खबर नहीं दी जाती। लेकिन यहां रिश्वतखोरी नहीं हुई। परन्तु हम क्या इल्जाम दे रहे हैं कि गांव वालों ने जरूर कुछ औजार छिपाकर रखे होंगे। जो कंसाइमेंट है उसमें कुछ मिला, कुछ नहीं मिला। लेकिन हम किस के लेविल से बोल रहे है। मलकानी जी अपने लेविल से बोल रहे हैं या कांग्रेस के नेता अपने लेविल से बोल रहे हैं। उनको अगर मालूम होता तो वह दो-चार एक॰के॰-47 अपने घर पर ले जाकर रख देते। गांव के आम लोग जिन्होंने यह समझा कि यह हमारे काम का नहीं है और इस बारे में पुलिस को खबर देना चाहिए कि यह कुछ बड़ा नुकसान वाला मामला है। हिन्दुस्तान की हुकूमत जो काम नहीं कर पाई कि बंगाल की गवर्नमैंट को खबर करनी चाहिए, वह जो गवर्नमैंट मशीनरी है, वह लोकल पुलिस है और वहां जाकर वह खबर देती है और उसके बाद गांव के लोग वहां के लोकल पंचायत, तमाम लोग अलग-अलग, यहां तक कि जो आर्मी के पर्सोनल छुट्टी में गए हुए थे, उन्होंने ढूंढ ढांढकर निकाला। मैं बचाई देता हूं कि मंत्री जी गए है। जो जिस तरह से निकला है उसके बारे में यह डिटेल है .....(समय की घंटी).....

अब सवाल आता है कि यह जो आर्म्ड कांस्प्रेसी है-प्रोक्योरमैंट हुआ, इसको लाया गया, लोड किया गया, कैरी किया गया, ड्रॉप किया गया, इसके लिए पैसे दिए गए, पेमेंट हुए। तो हर लेविल पर कौन जुड़ा हुआ है? मैं अपनी बात नहीं कहता। मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट फार होम एफ्फेयर्स ने परसों जो जवाब दिया है, मैं उसको कोट कर रहो हूं। मैंडम्, सवाल था:

> "Whether the investigation by the Central investigating agencies has proved the involvement of Anand Margis in the case?"

The reply was:

> "Investigations so far conducted by the Central Bureau of Investigation indicate the involvement of Anand Margis in the case. The CBI are further investigating the matter to find out whether Anand Margis were the ultimate end-users of the weapons or whether they were to be a conduit for some other groups."

मैड्म, अपने मुल्क की इंवेस्टीगेशन एजेंसी के बारे में मैं कोई मत न देकर के भी कह सकता हूं कि चाहे वह पैसे की चोरी हो, चाहे किकवैक्स हो, चाहे आर्म्स हो उसमें एंड यूजर्स को निकालना मुश्किल हो जाता है। जब किसी भी स्कैम के एंड यूजर्स को ढूंढकर निकालना मुश्किल हो जाती है तो यह आर्म्स स्कैम का एंड यूजर्स कैसे निकलेगा, हमें नहीं मालूम है। लेकिन यह तो बात तय है कि आनंदमार्गियों ने कंड्यूट की हैसियत से काम किया। हम बंगाल के लोग बड़े परेशान हैं, वर्षों से परेशान हैं। आनंदमार्गी एक ऐसा संगठन है, मैं उसके बारे में तफशील से नहीं जाना चाहता। बंगाल गवर्नमैंट ने एक व्हाईट पेपर भी निकला है और इस आर्म्स स्कैम को पहले ही बताया है जो उसकी एक्टिविटीज है। इन लोगों का जहां-जहां बेस हैं, हमेशा यह चक्कर लगा रहता है, जमीन दखल लेकर के मारा-मारी से, झगड़े से, हमेशा से परेशनी होती रहती है। लेकिन यह लोग संयासी है। यह अच्छे-अच्छे लिबास पहन करके के घूमते रहते है। अभी उन के यहां रेड हुई जैसा कि अभी जैन के घर में निकला, इसमें एक अखबार ने लिखा है कि यह आलीशन महल में रहते हैं, वैसे तो यह सब संन्यासी महाप्रभु भी एक-एक महल में रहते हैं। उनके यहां रेड हुआ। अखबार वाले भी पहुंचे थे। उन्होंने लिखा कि अगर सरकार वहां टिकट लगा दे तो देखने वालो कि लाईन लग जाएगी तथा राष्ट्रपति भवन या ताज महल को देखने के बजाय लोग उन महलों को देखने के लिए लाईन लगा देंगे। ज्योति वसु के ऊपर गोली चलाई थी, ये पटना स्टेशन पर एक शरस को मार गये थे जो मंत्री या नेताओं को घेर पर रखते हैं। उसी के बाद से आज तक वह इनकी हिट लिस्ट में है, वरना ज्योति वसु को ज्यादा सिक्योरिटी लेकर घूमने की जरूरत नहीं है, उनको केन्द्र सरकार ने बताया कि आपको जेड केटेगरी की सुरक्षा देनी पड़ेगी क्योंकि आप आनन्द मार्गियों की हिट लिस्ट में नम्बर वन हैं। इसके बावजूद भी इस मुल्क में, इस मुल्क के बाहर से रूपया आ रहा है, औजार आ रहे हैं, लोग आ रहे है, लोग जा रहे हैं। एक के बजाय दस पासपोर्ट बन रहे हैं, नकली पासपोर्ट बन रहे हैं, कान्सप्रेसी हो रही है, हम आराम से सो रहे हैं, डिफेन्स मिनिस्ट्री को सर्वलियन्स की जरूरत थी, एयरक्राफ्ट का मामला टेक्नीकल है। कोई छोटा सा एयीक्राफ्ट अगर हमारे मुल्क में आता है, डी॰जी॰सी॰ए॰ ने परमीशन देकर गलती की तो इसकी तहकीकात होनी चाहिए। लेकिन उस सर्वेलियन्स के लिए राडार और एयरक्राफ्ट कन्ट्रोलर के पास भी इन्तजाम नहीं हैं कि यह समझ सके कि कहां से बोल रहे है, कितनी हाइट से बोल रहे हैं, कैसे बोल रहे हैं? यह हमारी डिफेन्स मिनिस्ट्री का काम है कि वह सर्वेलियन्स करे। हम को मालूम हुआ है कि हम डिफेन्स

मिनिन्ट्री पर्सनल के खिलाफ कुछ नहीं बोलते लेकिन जिस देश में वर्षों से डिफेन्स मिनिस्टर ही नहीं है, जब से शरद पवार जी गये है, तो उस देश की डिफेन्स मिनिस्ट्री क्या करेगी? जहां एयर सर्वेलियन्स होना चाहिए था वहां रात 10 बजे के बाद कर के सो जाते हैं, हम भी सो जाते हैं। अगर रात में बम्बिंग भी हो जाता किसी जगह पर तो हमें मालूम होता। रात 10 बजे के बाद हम लोग सो रहे थे और हमारे साथ बाकी सब लोग भी सो गये थे क्योंकि सरकार ने ऐसे मैसेज दिए हैं कि ज्यादा काम करना नहीं पड़े। जब आपने परमीशन दी तब आप में हाई लेबल पर उस प्लेन को ट्रेक करने का कोआर्डिनेशन होना चाहिए था और जैसे कि गुरूदास जी बोले, मलकानी जी बोले कि वह प्लेन इससे पहले भी आया, रिहर्सल की, बनारस में ठहरा। उसके पास कम्युनिकेशन के नेटवर्क हैं। अपने देश में आनन्द मार्गी के लोग हैं, मैं आनन्द मार्गी बोल रहा हूं कोटिंग फ्राम सी॰बी॰आई॰। बनारस में लोग आनन्द मार्गी के आफिस में, कलकत्ते में, मुम्बई में, पूना में दिल्ली में, हर जगह पर जहां आनन्द मार्गी के आफिस थे, उनका इस्तेमाल किया, कम्युनिकेट किया और उसके बाद भी होम मिनिस्टर अपनी स्टेटमेंट में कहते हैं, हां आनन्द मार्गी का इन्वाल्वमेंट है।

"It needs futher investigation for confirmation."

लोग जानना चाहते हैं, हम जानना चाहते हैं, इस सदन को बताना पडेगा कि हमारी जनता के पास और गांव के लोगों के पास कितने हथियार निकले? अगर आप यह लिस्ट देते हैं तो जो सीजर लिस्ट आनन्द मार्गी की जो बीस-तीस जगह पर छापे मारे और वहां से जो कुछ मिला उसकी सीजर लिस्ट आपको हमें देनी चाहिए थी जिससे मालूम होता कि आप क्या कर रहे हैं और जो अफसर इन्वेस्टीगशन कर रहे हैं, हम उनका धन्यवाद करते हैं कि सरकार के सोने के बावजूद भी जो इन्वेस्टीगेट एजेन्सी है सी॰बी॰आई॰ जो लोग संजीदगी से काम कर रहे हैं, कहां-कहां तक करेंगे, उन्हें कहां तक रेसपान्स मिलेगा, मुझे मालूम नहीं है और तब तक जो हमें मालूम हुआ है वह भी चौंका देने वाली बात है।

क्या सी॰बी॰आई॰ का यह कहना सच है कि लेटेस्ट इन्वैटीगेशन में यू॰एस॰ सिटीजन का भी नाम आया है और इण्टरपोल की भी बताया गया है उसके बावजूद भी कि यू॰एस॰ सिटीजन है, इसके बारे में क्या यह सच है कि सी॰बी॰आई॰ ने हमारी गवर्नमेंट के जरिए सी॰आई॰ए॰ से कटि करने की कोशिश की और यह कहा कि जो अमरीकन सिटीजन है इसके बारे में आप हमें बताये और क्या यह भी सच है कि सी॰आई॰ए॰ यह कहती है कि नहीं-नही —"We are incapable". हम इस बारे में आप को कुछ नहीं बता सकते हैं। "I am just referring to the news item. जो निकला है, जो आपके ज्वाइंट डाइरेक्टर प्रेस को बोले थे, उस बारे में पूछ रहा हूं। आल रेडी सी॰बी॰आई॰ के ऊपर बहुत परेशानी है, कहां-कहां पर छापे मारते रहेंगे, कहां-कहां पर छापे डालते रहेंगे? इसके बावजूद भी यह जो इन्वेन्टीगेशन अथारिटी है वह शिकायत करे कि सी॰आई॰ए॰ कोआपरेट नहीं करता है। मैडम, इज इस सीरियस चार्ज, जिस तरह से कोआपरेट करना चाहिए था उस तरह से कोआपरेट नहीं करते हैं, यह नहीं होना चाहिए। सरकार द्वारा आपको एश्योरेंस देना चाहिए कि सेन्ट्रल गवर्नमेंट से पहले जो-जो गलती हो गई है अब उसे सीरियसली, देखना पड़ेगा। —You mean business and you will help them. किसी जगह पर, कहीं गिरावट पैदा नहीं होगी।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude because I have to call others. I have many names. (*Interruptions*)

I have many other names.

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: तो मैं यह कह रहा हूं स्टेटमेंट का जो ग्यारहवां पैरा है, इलेविंथ पैरा है, मंत्री महोदय ने यह बताया, मैं रीड नहीं कर रहा हूं, जनवरी में जो सर्च कंडक्ट हुई, उसके बारे में भी डिटेल में इन्फर्मेशन शेयर करेंगे? मंत्री महोदय पैरा 12 के बारे में थोड़ा इलोबरेटली बोंले, ऐसा हम चाहेंगे। यह जो पैरा 14 है इसमें है कि:

"The investigation, so far, indicates that the fire arms were meant to be received by certain Anand Margis."

तो क्या ऐसा भी है कि कुछ बाहर गिरे, इसलिए वह मालूम हो गया। लेकिन कोई ऐसी कन्साइनमेंट पहले वहां मिली या नहीं मिली है? अगर मिली है तो क्या इसका इस्तेमाल करके उनको वापस भेज दिया गया? इसके बारे में हम ज्यादा इन्फर्मेशन चाहते हैं। आप जिस तरह से बोल रहे हैं कि:

"...these arms were meant to be received by certain Anand Margis."

हम थोड़ा ज्यादा इन्फर्मेशन मांग रहे है क्योंकि हम जानते है कि आप एक बहुत वरिष्ठ नेता है, सुलझे हुए हैं और बहुत बैलेंस्ड बात करते हैं। जब आप इतनी बात कहते हैं तो जरूर उसकी कोई बुनियाद होगी। तो जिस आधार पर आप यह कह रहे हैं, क्या इस आधार को सदन के साथ शेयर कर सकते हैं और उस संगठन के बारे में, जिस संगठन को मलकानी जी और आपको कांग्रेस के कुछ नेता डिफेंड करते है.....(व्यवधान).

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: We are not defending..... (*Interruptions*).... We are not defending. ....(*Interruptions*).....

उपसभापति: वह कह रहे हैं वे नहीं डिफेंड करते हैं।

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: हमारा इंटेशन यही था जब कोई व्यक्ति या एजेंसी किसी मामले की तहकीकात करती है तो पावर में बैठे हुए जो लोग हैं, एम०एल०ए०, एम०पी० से लेकर प्राइम मिनिस्टर का चपरासी तक वह उसको इनफ्लुयेंस करना चाहता है और जो इनवेस्टीगेशन एजेंसी है वह डरती है कि हमें कितनी दूर तक जाना चाहिए, हम कहां तक जाएं। जो इस तरह को जब कोई हादसा होता है तो उसको एक पोलिटिकल गेम बनाकर हमारे एम०पी० और पार्टी के लोग उसको डिफेंड करते हैं। इसलिए कोई ऐसा स्टेटमेंट नहीं देना चाहिए जिससे इनवेस्टीगेटिंग एजेंसीज को मैसेज जाए। ऐसा मैसेज उनको नहीं देना चाहिए कि हम ऐसे आर्गनाइजेशन के पीछे हैं। हमारा इरादा यही था कि मलकानी जी के बारे में अखबारों में यह न आए कि इस प्रस्ताव पर बोलते हुए उन्होंने बंगाल पुलिस और बंगाल गवर्नमेंट को क्रिटिसाइज किया कि यह आनन्दमर्गियों को हराश कर रहे हैं और कांग्रेस के सदस्यों के साथ आनन्दमर्गियों को लपेटा जा रहा है। सी०बी०आई० को ऐसा मैसेज नहीं जाना चाहिए। अगर कांग्रेस के छोटे मोटे नेता आनन्द से जुड़े भी हो तो सरकार को आनन्दमार्गियों को डिफेंड नहीं करना चाहिए।

†श्री मोहम्मद सलीम "जारी": तो यहां पर जो है- तो एक तो है - सेन्ट्रल गवर्नमेन्ट दूसरा है- स्टेट गवर्नमेन्ट बिहार और बंगाल सेन्ट्रल गवर्नमेन्ट का मतलब हमने बताया कि जो दूसरे डिपार्टमेन्ट हैं- डी-जी-सी-ए- और डिफेंसेस वगैरह- तीसरा वह है कानस्पिरेटर्स में इसमें नहीं जाऊंगा- मलकानी जी कुछ कहेंगे- गवर्नमेन्ट इस जी कुछ कहेंगे- मैं इस पर बहस में आऊंगा- सरकारी रिपोर्ट से मैं कह रहा हूं- चूंकि आप बोलेंगे- कि बंगाल की गवर्नमेन्ट दुश्मनी से कैसे बोल सकती है हम बंगाल के लोग कैसे बोल सकते हैं- लेकिन एक बहुत बड़ा मैसेज वर्ल्ड में गया है- आपको इन्वेस्टीगेशन की रिपोर्ट मिल गई थी- इसके बावजूद भी ये जो कानस्पिरेटर्स हैं- इससे पता चलता है कि इन्टरनेशनल लेवल की कानस्पिरेसी है- फिर भी आपने कुछ नहीं किया- किसने किया फिर- मेडम यहां पर और भी कई हैं- वह हैं पश्चिम के आदिवासी आदिवासी लोग गांवों के- सरकार के डिफेंसेस के लिए हम खर्च करते हैं- पुलिस रखते हैं बहुत कुछ रखते हैं हमारे इस मुल्क में आर्- डी- एक्स लाया जाता है- तो कस्टम से लेकर- पुलिस से लेकर कोस्टल गार्ड से लेकर के बाद के बाद तलाशी होती है- तफ्तीश की- एस- एफ- के पर्सनल कुछ लेकर के इसके बावजूद भी हमारे मुल्क में आता है- जब वह औजार पकड़े गए तो गांवों के लोग इसको लेकर के खबर देते हैं- तो इस मुल्क की हिफाजत हुकूमत कर सकती है- नारायण स्वामी जी जो गवर्नमेन्ट को लेकर बहस कर रहे हैं वह गवर्नमेन्ट हिफाजत नहीं कर सकती अगर हिफाजत करने वाले हैं तो वह लोग हैं जो गरीब लोग हैं- गरीब जनता है इनमें कम से कम इतनी चेतना तो है कि इसके बारे में

ہے اسکے بارے میں یہ ڈیٹیل ہیں "تھی"
اب سوال آتا ہے کہ یہ جو آرمڈ کا لیٹر ہیں
ہے - پر کیور منٹ ہوا - اسکو لایا گیا - لوڈ
کیا گیا - ڈراپ کیا - اسکے لئے پیسے دیئے گئے -
پیمنٹ ہوئے تو پھر لیول پر کون جیرل ہوا ہے
میں اپنی بات نہیں کہتا - منسٹر آف اسٹیٹ
فار ہوم افیئرس نے پرسوں جو جواب دیا
ہے میں اسکو کوٹ کر رہا ہوں میڈم سوال
تھا -:[]

"Whether the investigation by the Central investigating agencies has proved the involvement of Anand Margis in the case?"

The reply was:

"Investigations so far conducted by the Central Bureau of Investigation indicate the involvement of Anand Margis in the case. The CBI are further investigating the matter to find out whether Anand Margis were the ultimate end-users of the weapons or whether they were to be a conduit for some other groups."

میڈم - اپنے ملک کی انویسٹیگیشن
ایجنسی کے بارے میں میں کوئی مت نہ دیکر
کے بھی کہہ سکتا ہوں کہ چاہے وہ پیسے کی
چوری ہو - چاہے کلیکیشن ہو - چاہے آرمس
ہوں اسمیں اینڈ یوزرس کو نکالنا مشکل
ہوجاتا ہے - جب کسی بھی اسکیم کے اینڈ
یوزرس کیسے نکلے گا - ہمیں نہیں معلوم ہے
لیکن یہ تو بات طے ہے کہ آنند مارگیوں نے
کنڈیوٹ کی حیثیت سے کام کیا - ہم بنگال

ہم جاکر خبر دیدیں - پر تو جب آر - ڈی -
ایکس کے بارے میں کسٹم آفیسر کو معلوم
ہوجاتا ہے پھر بھی وہ خبر نہیں دی جاتی -
لیکن یہاں رشوت خوری نہیں ہوئی -
پر تو ہم کیا الزام دے رہے ہیں - گاؤں
والوں نے ضرور کچھ اونا سمجھا کر رکھے
ہونگے - جو کنسائنمنٹ ہے اسمیں کچھ ملا
ہے - کچھ نہیں ملا - لیکن ہم کس کے لیول
سے بول رہے ہیں - ملکانی جی اپنے لیول سے
بول رہے ہیں - یا کانگریس کے نیتا اپنے
لیول سے بول رہے ہیں انکو اگر معلوم ہوتا
تو وہ دو چار اے - کے ۴۷ اپنے گھر پر
لے جاکر رکھ دیتے گاؤں کے عام لوگوں نے یہ
سمجھا کہ یہ ہمارے کام کا نہیں ہے اور اس
بارے میں پولیس کو خبر دینا چاہیے کہ
کچھ بڑا نقصان والا معاملہ ہے جھارکھنڈ
کی حکومت جو کام نہیں کر پائی کہ بنگال کی
گورنمنٹ کو خبر کرنی چاہیئے - وہ جو گورنمنٹ
مشینری ہے وہ لوکل پولیس ہے - اور
وہاں جاکر وہ خبر دیتی ہے اور اسکے بعد
گاؤں کے لوگ وہاں کی لوکل پنچایت -
تمام لوگ الگ الگ یہاں تک جو آرمی کے
پرسونل چھٹی پر گئے ہوئے انھوں نے ڈھونڈ
ڈھانڈ کر نکالا - میں بڑھا کر بتا رہا ہوں
کہ منتری جی گئے ہیں - جو جس طرح سے نکلا

[] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

ہیں - اسی کے بعد سے آج تک وہ اکی ہفٹ لسٹ میں ہیں - ورنہ جیوتی باسو کو زیادہ سیکیورٹی لیکر چلنے کی ضرورت نہیں ہے - انکو انٹیلی جنس سرکار نے بتایا کہ آپکو زیڈ کیٹیگری کی سرکشا دینی پڑیگی - کیونکہ آپ آتنکوادیوں کی ہفٹ لسٹ میں ہیں نمبر ون پر - اسکے باوجود بھی اس ملک میں - اس ملک کے باہر سے روپیہ آ رہا ہے - اور ہزار آ رہے ہیں لوگ آ رہے ہیں لوگ جا رہے ہیں - ایک کے بجائے دس پاسپورٹ بن رہے ہیں - کانپریسی ہو رہی ہے - ہم آرام سے سو رہے ہیں ڈیفنس منسٹری کو سرویلینس کی ضرورت تھی - ایئر کرافٹ کا معاملہ ٹیکنیکل ہے - کوئی چھوٹا سا ایئر کرافٹ اگر ہمارے ملک میں آتا ہے - ڈی - جی - ایس - اے - نے پرمیشن دیکر غلطی کی تو اسکی تحقیقات ہونی چاہیئے - لیکن اس سرویلینس کیلئے راڈار اور ایئر کرافٹ کنٹرولر کے پاس بھی انتظام نہیں ہے کہ یہ سمجھ سکیں کہ کہاں سے بول رہے ہیں - کتنی ہائٹ سے بول رہے ہیں - کیسے بول رہے ہیں - یہ ہماری ڈیفنس منسٹری پرسونل کے خلاف کچھ نہیں بولتے ہیں لیکن جس دیش میں برسوں سے ڈیفنس منسٹر نہیں ہے جب سے شرد پوار جی گئے ہیں -

سے لوگ بڑے پریشان ہیں - وہ شہروں سے پریشان ہیں - آنند مارگی ایک ایسا سنگھٹن ہے میں اسکے بارے میں تفصیل میں نہیں جانا چاہتا - بنگال گورنمنٹ نے ایک وہائٹ پیپر بھی نکالا ہے - اور اس اور اس آدمی اس اسکیم کو پہلے ہی بنایا ہے جو اسکی ایکٹی وٹیز ہیں - ان لوگوں کا جہاں جہاں بیس ہے - ہمیشہ یہ چکر لگا رہتا ہے زمین دخل لیکر کے مار دھاڑ سے جھگڑے سے - ہمیشہ سے پریشانی ہوتی رہتی ہے - لیکن یہ لوگ سنیاسی ہیں یہ اچھے اچھے لباس پہن کر گھومتے رہتے ہیں - ابھی انکے یہاں ریڈ ہوئی جیسا کہ ابھی جین کے گھر میں نکلا - اسمیں ایک اخبار نے لکھا ہے کہ یہ ایک عالیشان محل میں رہتے ہیں - ویسے تو یہ سب سنیاسی مہاپربھو بھی ایک ایک محل میں رہتے ہیں انکے یہاں ریڈ ہوا - اخبار والے بھی پہونچے تھے - انھوں نے لکھا کہ اگر سرکار وہاں ٹکٹ لگادے تو دیکھنے والوں کی لائن لگ جائیگی - تمھارا راشٹرپتی بھون یا تاج محل کو دیکھنے کے بجائے لوگ ان محلوں کو دیکھنے کیلئے لائن لگا دینگے - جیوتی باسو کے اوپر گولی چلائی تھی یہ پٹنہ اسٹیشن پر ایک شخص کو مار گئے تھے - جو منتری یا نیتاؤں کے گھیر کو دیکھتے

جاننا چاہتے ہیں - ہم جاننا چاہتے ہیں۔
اس سدن کو بتانا پڑیگا - کہ ہماری جنتا
کے پاس اور گاؤں کے پاس کتنے ھتیار
نکلے - اگر آپ یہ لسٹ دیتے ہیں - تو
سیجر لسٹ آنند مارگی کی جو بیس تیس
جگہ پر چھاپے مارے - اور جو کچھ وہاں سے
ملا اسکی سیجر لسٹ آپکو ہمیں دینی
چاہیئے تھی - جس سے معلوم ہوتا کہ
آپ کیا کر رہے ہیں اور جو افسر انویسٹی گیٹ
کر رہے ہیں ہم انکا دھنیہ واد کرتے ہیں۔
کہ سرکار کے سونے کے باوجود بھی جو
انویسٹیگیشن ایجنسی ہے سی - بی - آئی -
جو لوگ سنجیدگی سے کام کر رہے ہیں -
کہاں کہاں تک کریں گے - انھیں کہاں تک
ریسپانس ملیگا - مجھے معلوم نہیں ہے اور
تب تک جو ہمیں معلوم ہوا ہے وہ بھی چونکا
دینے والی بات ہے -

کیا سی - بی - آئی - کا یہ کہنا صحیح ہے کہ
لیبیٹ انویسٹیگیشن میں یو - ایس -
سیٹیزن کا بھی نام آیا اور ہم نے بتایا کہ
انٹرپول کو بتایا گیا - اسکے باوجود بھی
جو یو - ایس - سیٹیزن ہے اسکے بارے
میں کیا یہ سچ ہے کہ سی - بی - آئی - ہماری

تو اس دیش کی ڈیفینس سروسیز کیا کریگی -
وہاں جو ایئر سروسیز ہونا چاہیئے تھا وہ
رات دس بجے کے بعد بند کرکے سو جاتے
ہیں - ہم بھی سو جاتے ہیں - اگر رات میں
بمبنگ ہوتا ہے تو کسی جگہ پر تو ہمیں سلام
ہوتا ہے کہ رات ۱۰ بجے کے بعد ہم لوگ سو
رہے تھے - اور ہمارے ساتھ باقی سب
لوگ بھی سو گئے تھے کیونکہ سرکار نے ایسے
میسیج بھیجدئے ہیں کہ زیادہ کام نہیں کرنا
پڑیگا - جب آپنے پرمیشن دی تب آپ میں
ہائی لیول پر اس پبلین کو ٹریک کرنے کا
کوارڈی نیشن ہونا چاہیئے تھا - اور جیسے
کہ گرودا س جی بولے ملطانی بولے کہ وہ
پلین اس سے پہلے بھی آیا دیہر سل کی -
بنارس میں ٹھہرا اسکے پاس کمیونیکیشن کے
نیٹ ورک ہیں - اپنے دیش میں جو آنند
مارگی لوگ ہیں - جو آنند مارگی بول رہا ہو
کوئنگ فراہم سی - بی - آئی - بنارس میں لوگ
آنند مارگی کے آفس میں - کلکتے میں - بامبے
میں - پونا میں دلی میں - ہر جگہ پر جہاں
آنند مارگی کے آفس تھے - انکا استعمال
کیا - کمیونیکیٹ کیا اور اسکے بعد بھی
ہوم منسٹر صاحب اپنی اسٹیٹمنٹ میں کہتے
ہیں - ہاں آنند مارگی کا انوالومنٹ ہے -
"ان نیڈس فرد ر انویسٹیگیشن" - لوگ

گورنمنٹ کے ذریعے سے سی۔آئی۔اے۔ سے کانٹیکٹ کرنے کی کوشش کی اور یہ کہا کہ جو امریکن سیشن ہیں اسکے بارے میں آپ ہمیں بتائیں اور کیا یہ بھی سچ ہے کہ سی۔آئی۔اے۔ یہ کہتی ہے کہ نہیں نہیں "وی۔آر ان لیپ ایبل" ہم اسکے بارے میں آپکو کچھ نہیں بتا سکتے ہیں "آئی ایم جسٹ ریفرنگ ٹو دی نیوز آئٹم"۔ جو نکلا ہے۔ جو آپکے جوائنٹ ڈائریکٹر پریس کو بولے تھے۔ اس بارے میں پوچھ رہا ہوں آل ریڈی سی۔بی۔آئی کے اوپر بہت پریشانی ہے۔ کہاں کہاں پر چھاپے مارتے رہینگے۔ کہاں کہاں پر ڈالتے رہینگے۔ اسکے باوجود بھی یہ جو انویسٹمنٹ اخباری ہے وہ شکایت کرے کہ سی۔آئی۔اے۔ کوآپریٹ نہیں کرتا ہے۔ میڈم۔ اٹ از سیریس جاب۔ جس طرح سے کوآپریٹ کرنا چاہیئے تھا اس طرح سے کوآپریٹ نہیں کرتے ہیں۔ یہ نہیں ہونا چاہیئے۔ سرکار دوارا آپکو ایشورینس دینا چاہیئے کہ سینٹرل گورنمنٹ سے پہلے جو جو غلطی ہوگئی ہے۔ لیکن اب سے سیریس ریٹلی اسکو دیکھنا پڑیگا۔ "یو مین بزنس۔ اینڈ یو ول میلپ دیم"۔ کسی جگہ پر کہیں گروپ پیدا نہیں ہوگا۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude because I have to call others..... (*Interruptions*)

I have many other names.

†شری محمد سلیم: تو میں یہ کہہ رہا ہوں اسٹیٹمنٹ کا جو گیاروال پیرا ہے۔ الیونتھ پیرا ہے۔

منتری مہودے نے یہ بتایا میں ریڈ نہیں کر رہا ہوں۔ جنوری میں جو سوچ لگزکٹ ہوئی۔ اسکے بارے میں بھی ڈیٹیل میں انفارمیشن شیئر کرینگے۔ منتری مہودے پیرا ۱۲ کے بارے میں تھوڑا الوبریٹلی بولیں ایسا ہم چاہینگے۔ یہ جو پیراجراف ہے۔ اسمیں ہے کہ:

"The investigation, so far, indicates that the fire arms were meant to be received by certain Anand Margis."

†تو کیا ایسا بھی ہے کہ کچھ باہر گرے۔ اسلئے وہ معلوم ہو گیا لیکن کوئی ایسی کنسائنمنٹ پہنچے وہاں ملی یا نہیں ملی ہے۔ اگر ملی ہے تو کیا اسکا استعمال کرکے انکو واپس بھیج

†[] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

†[شری محمد سلیم: ہمارا انٹینشن یہی تھا کہ جب کوئی ایجنسی یا ایجنسی کسی معاملے کی تحقیقات کرتی تو پاور میں بیٹھے ہوئے جو لوگ ہیں - ایم - ایل اے ایم - پی سے لیکر پرائم منسٹر کا چپراسی تک وہ اسکا انفلیونس کرنا چاہتا ہے اور جو انویسٹیگیشن ایجنسی ہے وہ ڈرتی ہے کہ ہمیں کتنی دور تک جانا چاہیئے - ہم کہاں تک جائیں تو اس لئے کہ جب کوئی حادثہ ہوتا ہے تو اسکو ایک پولیٹیکل رنگ بنا کر ہمارے ایم - پی - اور پارٹی کے لوگ اسکو ڈفینڈ کرتے ہیں - اسلئے کوئی ایسا اسٹیٹمنٹ نہیں دینا چاہیئے جس سے انویسٹیگیٹنگ ایجنسیز کو میسیج جائے - ایسا میسیج انکو نہیں دینا چاہیئے - کہ ہم ایسے آرگنائزیشن کے پیچھے ہیں - ہمارا ارادہ یہی تھا کہ ملکانی جی کے بارے میں اخباروں میں یہ نہ آئے کہ اس پرستاؤ پر بولتے ہوئے انھوں نے بنگال پولیس اور بنگال گورنمنٹ کو کریٹی سائز کیا کہ یہ آنند مارگیوں کو ہراس کر رہے ہیں اور کانگریس کے ممبروں کے ساتھ آنند مارگیوں کو لپیٹا جا رہا ہے - سی - بی - آئی - کو ایسا میسیج نہیں جانا چاہیئے - اگر کانگریس کے چھوٹے موٹے نیتا

†[] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

دیا گیا - اسکے بارے میں ہم زیادہ انفارمیشن چاہتے ہیں - آپ جسطرح سے بول رہے ہیں کہ]

"...these arms were meant to be received by certain Anand Margis."

†[ہم تھوڑا زیادہ انفارمیشن مانگ رہے ہیں - کیونکہ ہم جانتے ہیں کہ آپ ایک بہت بڑی شوئے نیتا ہیں سمجھے ہوئے ہیں اور بہت بیلینسڈ بات کرتے ہیں - جب آپ اتنی بات کہتے ہیں تو ضرور اسکی کوئی بنیاد ہوگی تو جس آدھار پر آپ یہ کہہ رہے ہیں - کیا اس آدھار کو ہمیں کے ساتھ شیئر کر سکتے ہیں - اور اس سنگھٹن کے بارے میں جس سنگھٹن کو ملکانی جی اور آپکی کانگریس کے کچھ نیتا ڈفینڈ کرتے ہیں - - - "مداخلت" - - -]

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: We are not defending.....(*Interruptions*).... We are not defending... (*Interruptions*)...

†[آپ سمجھا پتی: وہ کہہ رہے ہیں کہ وہ ڈفینڈ نہیں کرتے ہیں -

آزاد ممبرز کسی جڑے بھی ہوں تو سرکار کو آزاد ممبرز کو کوٹ فیئر پنس کرنا چاہیئے

उपसभापति: अब आप बैठ जाइए।

श्री ओ॰पी॰ कोहली (दिल्ली): मैडम, जिनका नाम इसमें लिस्टेड है, उनको पहले बोलने का अधिकार होना चाहिए और उनको पहले समय मिलना चाहिए। वरना उनका नोटिस देने का क्या फायदा है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have the names of Mr. Gujral, Mr. Malaviya and then yours. Mr. Malaviya is not here.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, I hope that my name is there.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your name is there; all the names are there.

श्री ओ॰पी॰ कोहली: जिनका नाम लिस्ट में नहीं है उनको बाद में समय मिलना चाहिए और जिनका नाम है उनको पहले बोलने का समय दिया जाना चाहिए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will explain to you, Kohliji. The tradition, the convention, is that one Member from each party speaks. From those names which are listed, the party indicates one name who is going to speak on their behalf. Generally I accommodate other Members; but after those Members whose names are already listed and they have spoken. I am giving the names of all those Members whose names are listed. In place of Mr. Baby, Mr. Salim spoke; in place of Mr. Naresh Yadav, Mr. Gujral is going to speak. We won't violate any rules, we will definitely follow all rules. I hope that you would speak on this subject. I want that many Members of Parliament express their views on it because it is a very serious subject. There is no question of curtailing or cutting anybody's time. But, you should also speak within the time given. I will definitely give you time.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, allow me also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Here I have Gujralji's name first. After that I will call you.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): श्री राम गोपाल जी का नाम भी इसमें है।

उपसभापति: हां, उनका नाम लिखा है मेरे पास, राम गोपाल जी को। नारायणसामी जी के बाद बुला दूंगी।

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar): Madam, you may recall when I was speaking on the President's Address I had made a point, particularly regarding the security problem of this region and I had given some data. Today, again I say with regret that when the hon. Prime Minister, for whom I have great respect, came to reply to the debate I was hoping for a more detailed and comprehensive reply. That was missing. I was hoping that he would also talk about what Mr. Chavan has talked today, because not to talk of Purulia in terms of security of the nation would really be ignoring a very imortant aspect of it. We got lost in other things but security did not receive as much attention of the hon. Prime Minister end as it was expected to. The result is, today although the President in his Address had talked about some deficiencies in our defence in that region, we now see more than ever before, from the Home Minister's statement that the air corridor is very porous. But the sad thing is not that it is porous. Of course, it is sad and concern-causing. It is a very interesting to note one thing when Shri Gurudas Das Gupta gave this letter which is nerve-racking, if not nerve-shaking, and that is, we knew everything, I mean the Government of India going by this letter, the authenticity of which has not been denied by the Home Minister. It is an authentic letter, it has been placed on the Table of the House. It is the property of the House. It is a letter written by a Joint Secretary to the Government of Bengal. What does it say? As Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta

has given all the details, I would only say one thing, and I will not repeat them. To a degree I say with satisfaction that the Intelligence abroad, our intelligence, whether on their own or whatever network they have, was able to know that some deal was on. They knew that some arms dealer was trying to send some arms here. They had come to know that the first attempt to buy a small plane was aborted. They knew that an AN-26 had been purchased. They knew that would take off from Latvia. They knew it would go to Pakistan. They knew it would come to Banaras. They also knew where it would be dropping arms. All this information is authentic. And the Government of India knew all this. And that is where I want to draw the attention of my friend, the Home Minister. In his statement he does not talk about this. He does not tell us what he did with all this intelligence, which basically means that in the set-up of the Government of India as it is, the Intelligence and the Home Ministry have no coordination. And that has been my complaint all the time. Unfortunately—there is a long history behind it—all the intelligence has been centralised in the Prime Minister's office. The RAW reports there. The Central Intelligence reports there. All the reports from the embassies come and go there. And even in the financial matters, the enforcement goes to the Prime Minister. The Home Ministry is only there to make statements to us. They do not know what is happening and I do not blame them because unfortunately—I will not take your time—I was personally in the Government at that time when this process began of over-centralisation in the PMO and today that is happening. Anyhow, somehow or the other one Joint Secretary in the Government of India, his channel was used to give information to the Bengal Government. The fate of that information we have now known. Such a vital piece of information, which concerns the defence of India, which concerns the security of India, which was completely going to undermine us—I do not know how much more it is going to undermine—was known to us and yet not utilised. I would like to ask the Home Minister: When this information came to his notice,—leave alone the Bengal Government; I think Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta has amply talked about this subject, I am not going to talk about that again—when the information came to the Government of India,—I do not know which section it came to,—what did he do with the information? You sent a routine letter to the Bengal Government and that was finished. Did it tell Banaras that something is likely to happen? Did it tell Purulia that something is likely to happen? Did it tell our own Intelligence to spread the network in Banaras and in Purulia to keep a watch on this? Did it tell the Civil Aviation Department that the plane was likely to take this route and they should be cautious about it? If it did, when the plane reached Banaras and for hours it was there, why didn't the Civil Aviation Ministry, the Intelligence, police and all the paraphernalia that we have and the U.P. Government under President's rule, search the plane? Why did they not search the plane?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: May I just supplement one thing? I missed it. A Davy, one of the conspirators, who was in the plane could go out of the plane and escape when the plane landed in Bombay.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: That has been referred to by the hon. Minister.

SHRI MD. SALIM: That has been referred to in the statement.

SHRI GURUDS DAS GUPTA: If it has been referred to, I would like to know as to what action has been taken by the concerned State Government whose responsibility it is to look after the security of the airport.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: The Airport Police is separate. (*Interruptions*)

Shri MD. SALIM: The Airport Police is manned by the State Government. (*Interruptions*)

Shri K.R. Malkani: The plane was forcelanded. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We go by his statement that the plane was forcelanded. I go by his statement. But after the plane was forcelanded, what was the mechanism at the disposal of your own organisation to see that everybody who was there on the plane was taken into custody? This is a serious lapse on the part of the Government.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: I go one step before that.

Madam, according to the letter of the Government of India, even the route was known. May I know: why was the plane not forcelanded before it reached Varanasi? Why was the plane not forcelanded the moment it crossed our border? Why was not the plane forcelanded the moment it came into our airspace? Why did we have to wait till they completed the operation? By chance it came back by the same route; foolishly, perhaps. If it had not come back by the same route, we would not have been able to apprehend these people.

Actually, till Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta read out the letter, I was under the impression that this poor Government did not know about it. I was under the impression that it did not know anything. I thought it was going by whatever was being said. I was having sympathy for the Government's lack of resources and inefficiency, sometimes. But here is a Government which knew everything. It knew that there was this AN-26 aircraft. It knew that the plane would start from Latvia. It knew that the plane would go to Pakistan. It knew that the arms would be loaded there. It knew that the plane would be landing in Varanasi. It knew that the plane would go through this route. Yet they kept quiet! It thought that it had discharged its responsibility by sending a lousy letter to the West Bengal Government; that is all!

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: By normal post!

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Normal post, we know what it is.

Therefore, Madam, this is what has happened. I would like to ask, firstly: What was the date when the intelligence information came to the Government of India? What was the action taken between that date and the date of armdrop, apart from sending this letter? This is something, I think, we are entitled to know.

I would also like to know—I repeat—if the intelligence was vigilant, what was the intelligence report *post facto* the intelligence that was collected? Was there a direction: 'Don't take any action; it will come back'? Was it the Government's information that the plane would come back on its own? If it as so, why was action not taken at Madras? Where was the lapse? Why was action not taken when the plane landed in Madras?

Another thing is about the long time being taken to decode the various information. The statement says that the Flight Data Recorder, which is commonly known as Black Box, the Velocity Height Gradient Recorder, the Global Positioning System and a Lap-top Computer, etc., are being scrutinised and the data is being analysed in detail. Madam, this incident happened about two months back. The Minister comes today and tells us that these are still being decoded. If this is the speed of decoding, I do not know how safe we can feel.

Madam, I will take a minute more. Now, the statement also says: 'However, the incident did reveal certain gaps withing the prevailing system relating to permission and clearances for operation of non-scheduled flights over the airspace of this country. Accordingly, an Inter-Ministerial Committee was set up to identify these gaps in order to strengthen the infrastructure and the co-ordination between the various agencies to prevent the recurrence of such an incident in the future. The Committee's report which contains wide-ranging recommendations has been accepted by the Government'. What are those recommendations?

Has the Committee also fixed responsibility on those culprits about whom Mr. Gurudas has talked? Has it also fixed responsibility on the Government of India for letting the border and the air-space to remain porous despite the information? If there was no information, I would have had some sympathy with them. But there was information.

Then, I come to this thing. What action has the Government taken in response to the letter written by the Government of West Bengal? It says, "The communication was received here on 26th of December. The registered envelope shows the receipt by the Calcutta GPO on 20th December. I enclosed a photo of the envelope" etc.etc. Here, a responsible bureaucrat of the Government of West Bengal is making the statement. Has it been dismissed as irresponsible, or has the Government taken action on this? I think, the Home Minister should tell us about this also.

I am finishing. What is happening today? A real, serious difficulty in the Government of

India is lack of coordination. There is no coordination at any level. That is why for more than a year I have been demanding setting up of a National Security Council. What has happened is this? This is one Government in the last fifty years, which does not have what is called a "Cabinet Committee on Political Affairs (CCPA). Mr. Arjun Singh was not to be taken. So, the CCPA was abolished. The entire Government is now being coordinated, managed and run by one single point, and that is PMO. I have no reflection on that person over there, but the systems must run systematically.

I think that the security of our region in that area particularly, starting from North Bengal going up to the North-East, the entire region, has been destabilised. Burma is being armed. China is taking action in that area also, and we sleep here under the custody of those who do not know what is happening under their nose! When they know it, they are paralysed because they do not know how to act.

Thank you.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman, the hon. Home Minister has said in para 15 that this was the first incident of an aircraft carrying weapons and dropping weapons in our country, thereby creating a kind of sensitivity in the whole nation.

Madam, the aircraft which took off from Karachi on 17th December, 1995, had a stop-over at Varanasi. Thereafter, the aircraft landed in Calcutta. They wanted permission to land at Rangoon. Since permission was refused, the aircraft dropped weapons by parachutes at Purulia and went to Madras and from there to Bombay.

Madam, the vital question is this. When flights enter our air-space or land at any airport, they have to get permission, identifying the consignments they are carrying. They have to get clearance. Only thereafter will the aircraft be allowed to enter the Indian air-space and fly in it.

Madam, to my mind, the system at the airports was not properly monitored. The aircraft was carrying arms and ammunition. But, whatever declaration it gave was accepted by the airport authorities. Thereafter, without verifying the consignment, the aircraft was allowed to take off and land at various airports. This is a very serious lapse on the part of the airport authorities in not verifying the consignment. when we go to any airport as passengers with a small hand-baggage, several checks and counter-checks are done.

But when spurious consignments of arms and ammunition are coming in an aircraft giving different names for the consignments and they went unchecked, it is a very serious matter. This is the first time that it was intercepted and taken care of. We do not know how many times on earlier occasions the aircraft landed in India with the contraband and it left this country without dropping anything in our country. Therefore, our hon. Home Minister has rightly pointed out that the Inter-Ministerial Committee is looking into the matter about the serious lapses taking place in the airport, when the chartered aircraft are landing in India and thereby using these aircraft for the purpose of activating their anti-national activities. For that there should be some monitoring authority so that that is checked. the police personnel manning the airport are not properly trained to check the consignments coming there. There should be a proper coordination between the custom officials and the intelligence agencies so that correct information reaches them in time enabling them to handle any situation arising out of the consignments used for anti-national activities coming through some of the aircraft. Madam, I found a lot of accusation from the Members belong to CPI, CPM and Janata Dal. I find that we are trying to jump to the conclusion in regard to the arms dropping about any particular persons or agencies involved. Mr. Gurudas Gupta is a very senior Member of the House. When he spoke, he said a letter has been received from the Joint Secretary stating that weapons are being smuggled and brought in an aircraft for the purpose of using it for destablising the West Bengal Government by some agencies which are against the State Government. Then some of the hon. Members spoke that Anand Margis were responsible for it and they were getting arms and ammunition. There is another theory which has also been reported. It was earlier reported that one Mr. Randy *alias* Satyanarayana Gowda hailing from Karnataka is involved in this. Now it is being said that he is from Bihar and his name is not Randy, but Satyanarayana. That gentleman is basically from Bihar having links

with Anand Margis. He is a notorious arms smuggler operating in the Bihar region for the Moist Communist Party. He has been supplying arms and ammunition. These groups of people have been giving protection to Satyanarayana, who has been sending arms supply to them.

There is another information. I am quoting from the Police investing agency from Patna. It says that on March 2, last year, they had a meeting in which they decided to bring weapons for the purpose of creating a law and order problem in the country at the time of the elections. For that they would like to bring more weapons into the system, especially in Bihar. Hon. Home Minister has very clearly said that available evidence indicates the involvement of the Anand Margis as far as bringing of arms into Purulia is concerned. Phuket is a very notorious and prominant place for bringing the arms supplies into the country and that airport is being used for the purpose bringing in arms and for taking off of the aircraft from that airport.

Madam, we know our neighbouring country, Pakistan has been very active in creative in creating a law and order problem in our country. Its agents are operating in Jammu and Kashmir, Punjab and other northern States of the country. When the weapons that had been brought and when the flight landed in Karachi, they had allowed them to be seggregated and they have done it in such a manner that arms and ammunition can be dropped in India through parachute. Bulgaria is one country, which the hon. Minister, has stated in his Statement, where the arms have been taken. In that country the arms were obtained. Madam, Bulgaria is a friendly country of India. I would like to know from the Minister whether the Bulgarian Government knew that these weapons which were obtained from their country would be used against India. I feel Bulgaria, a friendly country of ours, would not allow such kind of activities to take place on our soil. I would like to know from the Minister whether any inquiries have been made by the Government of India with the Bulgarian Government regarding the arms that have been obtained from there. For what purpose have they detained them? Who have obtained them? Who is responsible for them?

Madam, though we do not have friendly relations with Pakistan in spite of our efforts to have friendly relations, I would like to know from the Minister whether the Government of India has written to the Pakistan Government to find out whether they had prior information about the landing of the aircraft at Karachi airport containing weapons which were going to be used for anti-national activities in India. I know that Pakistan Government would not cooperate with India. But our duty is to request the Pakistan Government to provide us the information. I would like to know whether this has been done by the Government. Madam, this issue relates not only to India but to others also. It is an international conspiracy wherein the West Bengal Government is trying to blame the Central Government. This is not going to serve any purpose....(*Interruptions*)....

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, this is unfair.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, the CPM says it is correct.

But the CPI says it is not correct. What can I do?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Government of West Bengal never blamed anybody. It is the Government of India who stands blamed in the eyes of the public.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, I think Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta is not representing the Government of West Bengal.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: No. I am not representing the Government of West Bengal.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He is not from the CPM. That means we can take his statement as a CPI Member. We can take it that way.

SHRI MD. SALIM: The Government of India is not going to serve any purpose.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Government of West Bengal is also not going to serve any purpose....(*Interruptions*)....They are not tolerating my statement. I am not accusing anybody.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't accuse anybody. We have to find out if there was any lapse on anybody's part.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: In spite of the fact that the honourable Home Minister's statement that the West Bengal Government has to be given a pat, I have got my now reservations about it....(*Interruptions*).....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, you have made your point. Now Mr. Narayansamy is making his own point. He is a Member of this House. He has got his own view.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I know where Mr. Narayanasamy stands.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Every Member has got a right to express his views.

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKERJEE: Madam, Mr. Narayanasamy was speaking so very well, I do not know how he got derailed.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I do not want any kind of appreciation from the Members of West Bengal.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mr. Narayanasamy make his point. You have made your point. In your perception it was a mistake of the Central Government. In his perception whatever he fees let him express it. Why should you object to it? Let there be a discussion so that we can find out who is responsible for it. If every Member is going to make the same kind of speech, then, you write it down and give it to the Home Minister. He would make his own conclusion. Let there be a discussion on the subject. The meaning of a discussion is that different points should come and then a result should come. Mr. Narayanasamy, I am giving you my protection.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, the honourable Home Minister whithin his own rights has appreciated the effort of the State Government. I do not have any quarrel on that. But my information is that in spite of the information given by the villagers, the West Bengal Government did not take any prompt step to seize those weapons. The police authorities did not take any prompt steps. That is my accusation.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR (Uttar Pradesh): That is correct.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Are you giving this information from your own source or from the BJP source?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I am giving this information from the Communist Party source.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You do not know from which source he has got the information. It is a secret thing.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shri Satish Agarwal) *In the Chair*]

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, it took more than eight hours for them to go in search of the weapons in spite of the sensitive information that has been given to the police authorities there that arms had been dropped on a large scale in Purulia. And the Villagers went and complained to them! This is the state of affairs in the police department in West Bengal. I am sorry to say that. I want that to go on record. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MD. SALIM: It is given by the Home Minister here. There is a list. (*Interruptions*). Were they recovered by your activists?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The reply will be given by the hon. Home Minister. I am making my point. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, I want this to go on record. But for the West Bengal Government and the grassroot level democracy there, this cache could not have been recovered. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We know that. How many custodial deaths are taking place in West Bengal? (*Interruptions*). I know. Kindly do not quarrel on this. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: What is the source of your information? Is it the BJP or the Youth Congress?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I have told you that the source of information is the Communist Party only.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Kindly conclude, Mr. Narayanasamy. Please do not join issue with others.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, they join issue with me. When the hon. Members spoke, I kept quiet.

Blaming the Central Government alone on this issue by the State Government, for the purpose of suppressing their lapses, is not going to help them in any way.

Sir, I will conclude with one sentence. In paragraph 13, the hon. Home Minister has clearly stated that the Cockpit Voice Recorder and the Flight Data Recorder and so many other technical instruments have been collected which will give us vital information. The hon. Home Minister has mentioned only the instruments recovered by them. What is the source of information from which they got them? That will not only enlighten us but will also make it easy for the investigating agency in identifying the real culprits who have been involved in this global conspiracy of dropping arms in this country for the purpose of destabilising this country. It is not West Bengal alone but the whole country that is concerned. We are all concerned. It is not the West Bengal Government alone that is concerned. We are all concerned. The country's security is very important. Since it is the first case, as the hon. Home Minister has rightly observed, coordination among the various agencies of the Government of India and the State Government is vital in identifying the persons who have been operating or the foreign agencies or the Indian agencies which are operating in this country because nowadays, we find, in the name of drugs, in the name of 'hawala', in the name of any other organisation which want to demoralise this country, to dethrone this country from democracy.....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI MD. SALIM: Are you referring to something of 'hawala'?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: To destabilise the country, they were operating. Thereafter, our job as .....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: "Hawala" organisation? What is that?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I would like to add just one more sentence. Of all the States in this country, why was West Bengal alone chosen by these arms smugglers? It is because it is a soft area for them. The West Bengal Government would not do anything if weapons were landed there. Therefore, they found it to be a soft area. Otherwise, why are they not landing arms in other States? They have chosen West Bengal for this purpose which the hon. Members should understand and they should advise their State Government to keep their police intact, to give the police administration a new look so that the State Government can run efficiently and effectively. Thank you, Sir.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय: माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, जैसा कि गृह मंत्री जी ने स्वीकार किया और यह सत्य भी है कि आजादी के बाद से जिस प्रकार की घटना 16-17 दिसम्बर, 1995 को पश्चिमी बंगाल के पुरुलिया में घटी, ऐसी घटना आज तक कभी नहीं हुई। एक विदेशी विमान हमारे देश की धरती पर शस्त्र और गोला-बारूद गिरा गया और निश्चित रूप से इससे हमारी जो राष्ट्रीय सुरक्षा थी, वह खतरे में पड़ी है और यह भी बहुत आश्चर्य की बात है कि इस प्रकार की राष्ट्रीय सुरक्षा से संबंधित घटना हो जाए, शस्त्र और गोला-बारूद असामान से गिर जाए और उसके बारे में न तो केन्द्रीय सरकार को और न उसकी जितनी एजेंसियां हैं, उनको कोई जानकारी हो पाए! मैं केवल कुछ प्रश्न पूछना चाहूंगा।

एक तो चालक दल के सदस्य कोई किम पी. डेवी थे, जो मुम्बई हवाई अड्डे से फरार हो गए। उनको वहीं पर जांच के लिए, पूछताछ के लिए रोका गया था और जब इस प्रकार की घटना हुई, उसके बाद एक व्यक्ति को जांच के लिए रोका गया तो यह बड़े आश्चर्य की बात है कि किम पी॰डेवी॰ वहां से किस तरह से फरार हो गया, मुम्बई हवाई अड्डे से फरार हो गया। तो इसके बारे में गृह मंत्री जी स्पष्टीकरण करेंगे और जिनकी पूछताछ में वह थे, उनके विरुद्ध अभी तक कोई कार्यवाही की गई या नहीं की गई?

दूसरे कुछ समाचार पत्रों में यह भी खबर आई है कि ''रा'' को इसकी जानकारी थी। खबर गलत हो सकती है, मैं स्पष्टीकरण चाहता हूं कि जो इस प्रकार के समाचार आए हैं कि ''रा'' को इसकी जानकारी थी, वे सत्य हैं या नहीं?

मेरा अगला प्रश्न है कि सत्य नारायण गौडा, जिनके बारे में यह खबर आई, किसी ने कहा कि कर्नाटक के है, किसी ने कहा कि बिहार के औरंगाबाद के हैं और दूसरे एक सज्जन, जिनका कि मैंने अभी नाम लिया था ... किम पी. डेवी, इनके ऐंटीसिडेंट्स के बारे में सरकार को अब तक क्या जानकारी हुई है? सत्य नारायण गौडा कौन सज्जन हैं, कहां के हैं, उनके क्या ऐंटीसिडेंट्स रहे हैं?

वाराणसी और कलकत्ता में यह जहाज उतरे और वहां पर इनको फ्यूल भी दिया गया, तो मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि यह किन परिस्थितियों में हुआ? गृह मंत्री जी के स्पष्टीकरण के वक्तव्य को मैंने पढ़ा, उससे मुझे जानकारी नहीं हो पाई है, इसलिए मैं इसका भी उत्तर चाहूंगा। कुछ समाचार पत्रों में यह भी खबर आई है और उसको जब

तक मैं गृह मंत्री जी को सुनाऊंगा नहीं, गृह मंत्री जी बता भी नहीं सकेंगे कि उन्होंने कब यह कहा था। यह टाइम्स आफ इंडिया का अखबार है, कलकत्ता से। 27 दिसम्बर की खबर है, 28 दिसम्बर को छपी है। एक तो होम मिनिस्टर जी के लिए है:--

"The Union Home Minister, Mr. Shankarrao Chavan, also alleged that Pakistan was behind the arms air-drop. He told reporters today that although the incident of dropping arms from an aircraft was new to India, he felt that the whole espisode was engineered by Pakistan."

और दूसरे उसी खबर में यूनियन मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट फार होम सिब्ते रज़ी साहब को एट्रीब्यूट किया गया है:--

"The Union Minister of State for Home, Syed Sibtey Razi, said today that the involvement of Pakistan's Inter-services Intelligence (ISI) in the arms air dropping case could not be ruled out."

लेकिन जो गृह मंत्री जी ने आज वक्तव्य दिया है, करीब तीन पृष्ठ का, हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी में, उसमें पाकिस्तान की जो आई.एस.आई. एजेंसी है, इसकी कोई चर्चा उन्होंने नहीं की है। या तो हो सकता है कि अखबार वालों ने मिस-रिपोर्ट किया हो या हो सकता है कि किन्हीं कारणों से गृह मंत्री जी ने इस चीज को आज अपने वक्तव्य में नहीं दिया। मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि निश्चित रूप से यह काम ऐसे लोगों का है जो भारत के दुश्मन हैं और जो भारत का अहित चाहते हैं, भारत के लोगों का अहित चाहते हैं। इसलिए इस संबंध में जब इतना स्पष्ट वक्तव्य गृह मंत्री जी का आया है क्योंकि इसमें आपने यह भी कहा है कि सितम्बर, 1975 में, किसी अभियुक्त ने स्वीकार किया है कि सारे अंतर्राष्ट्रीय षडयंत्र की संरचना बैंकाक में हुई। तो विभिन्न प्रकार की बातें आई हैं। तो मैं चाहता हूं कि गृह मंत्री जी पाकिस्तान की आई.एस.आई. के संबंध में निश्चित रूप से अपना स्पष्टीकरण करें और आज क्योंकि पहली इस प्रकार की दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण घटना हुई है, खतरनाक घटना हुई है, इस देश की राष्ट्रीय सुरक्षा के संबंध में इस प्रकार की घटना हुई है कि आसमान से शस्त्र और गोला-बारूद गिरा दिया गया, तो सरकार को इस संबंध में जरूरी कदम उठाने चाहिएं, निर्णय लेना चाहिए और इनकी जो एजेंसियां हैं, उनके काम के बारे में रिव्यू करना चाहिए जिससे कम से कम भविष्य में फिर इस प्रकार की घटना न घटे। तो मेरा यह प्रश्न है कि जो भी ऐसी इंटरनल एजेंसीज़ हैं या ऐक्सटर्नल सिक्योरिटी अरैंजमैंट्स हैं, उनको रिव्यू करने के लिए भारत सरकार क्या फैसला लेने जा रही है, किस प्रकार से रिव्यू करेगी और रिव्यू करने के बाद क्या फैसला करेगी?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI (MAHARASHTRA): Mr. Chairperson, Sir, I must say that as a Member of this House and as an Indian citizen I speak with a sense of humiliation and a sense of foreboding and dismay. Sir, this is not an occasion to settle scores between the State Government and the Central Government. Nor is this an occasion to finally fix blame on any individuals or any organisations. The investigation is incomplete. The documents supplied to us are incomplete. In the absence of complete data it is impossible to arrive at any final conclusions and, Sir, I must preface my remarks by saying that everything that I say is absolutely tentative, *prima facie*, based upon the disclosed materials; anything that I say might hereafter turn out to be wrong, it may be falsified by a subsequent evidence or discovery. But, Sir, there are certain things which glare us in the face, and that calls for the fixation of political responsibility for, what I regard, acts of criminal negligence and dereliction of duty. The document consisting of the statement of the hon. Minister my friend called it a 'spurious document', but, Sir, I do not want to use that phrase—certainly starts with suppression of truth. It starts with the incidence of the 17th of December, 1995, whereas to the knowledge of the Government of India, particularly the Ministry of Home Affairs, events did not start on the 17th of December, but they started at least before the 12th of December. Sir, on the 12th of December, 1995 a Joint Secretary in the Ministry of Home Affairs was obviously activated into addressing a letter to somebody in West Bengal. Obviously this information, on which he acted, had been received prior to 12th of December. We have not been able to say what exactly the nature of the information is. At least the Home Minister has not told us. The nature of that information can be gleaned only from that letter which the Joint Secretary wrote. And, Sir, I want to say that if this is a kind of information which somebody in the British Government thought worth communicating to India—they are concerned with our safety and they are giving us information—one expects at least that much of vigilance and that much of concern from our officers who are paid by the tax-payers, the poor and unfortunate tax-payers of this country. This

information was obviously lying in their archives for quite some time and when this gentleman wrote a letter on the 12th of December, 1995,—Sir, I may be unfair to the gentleman, but if I was starting this investigation in this case, the first person to start the investigation with is this gentleman who wrote this letter; Sir, mightbe, I am a criminal lawyer and I easily suspect things sometimes, but often my suspicion and hunch come out to be true-see the manner in which this gentleman reacted to this vital information. And this information is so vital that even the Home Minister's statement says that this is the first time that such an incident has happened in the history of independent India! For the first time you receive information relating to something which is unheard of during the entire fifty years of our independence. It is so important that the British Government feels concerned about its colonial subjects...and wants to give you that information. But this gentleman wrote a letter, got it typed, put it in an envelope and despatched it by ordinary post as if he did not know the performance of the Postal Department in this Country. It reminds me of a story. When the owner of a stable asked the fellow whom he had appointed to guard his stable, "Why did you not do anything when the thieves came and stole the horse?", he said, "Sir, don't worry; they will return because they had forgotten the saddle; when they come for the saddle I will go something about it." So, this is exactly what this gentleman has done. This gentleman wanted only to write this letter for the sake of creating a defence for himself in case something happens in the future. But he was determined to see that no action was taken at the other end and this was not prevented. I would start first interrogating this gentleman: What is the circumstance? What is the information that you received? When did you receive it? What was the nature of that information? And why did you react in this manner?" We are living at the close of the 20th century. He is a Joint Secretary. He has no other method of communication on a matter of great importance to the security of this country! Sir, it could have been an atom bomb; It could have been a nuclear bomb. If a lapse of this magnitude has taken place, will you be able to prevent such lapses in the future unless some political heads are prepared to roll. This is the great principle of democracy which has to be established in this country because I find, time and again, politicians who are enjoying the perks of office, when faced with these kinds of unfortunate situations, have nothing to say except what this miserable document says on the last page and you see what it says. The document says that there is a failure of the system. Sir, this is nonsense which I have never accepted. The systems do not fail. It is the individuals, the corrupt, the incompetent, the inefficient individuals, who unfortunately man our systems and who are making a mockery of the perks of office which they get from the poor tax-payers, they fail. It is this gentleman who failed. Did this gentleman convey it to his superiors? Did the Minister of State for Home Affairs come to know about? Did the Home Minister come to know about it? A thing is happening which has never happened before in the history of freedom movement in India. And yet when this ordinary post letter reached, I must say to the credit of West Bengal Government, they reacted immediately. Not only that, they reacted to this news which they got locally and they investigated. Their people had gone there and they had caught all these arms. This imposing cache of arms have undoubtedly been recovered by the West Bengal police at a time when the Central forces had not intervened at all. This gentleman writes to the Home Secretary. What is this information which you are giving? Could you not in this speed age think of a faster method of communicating this information? This information, according to the postal stamp, reached the West Bengal post office on the 20th of December, three days after the deed has already been done. Sir, somebody's head must roll. I am not used to be courteous and I do not believe in the diplomatic circumlocutions of any kind. The heads of the highest political officer in the Home Ministery and the person who is in charge of the defence of our country must roll, if parliamentary democracy is to be sustained. After this information, the information which has come from the British Government is so precise. It is not in the Home Minister's statement. But it is there in the letter of his Joint Secretary. The information is that the pilot would land at an airstrip 86.20 degrees east and 24.40 degree north; it is located along a river with hills on either side and close to the

normal commercial air route from Karaehi to Dhaka. Sir, the information given by the British Government is that there was a certain gentleman who first tried to purchase these arms from a dealer. The dealer then walked out of the transactions. Then this dealer went to middle European countries, Latvia and other places and was trying to arrange for a cache of arms from these countries. I want to know, if they are serious about the investigation into this matter, whether they have gone back to the British Government for more information. Has anybody taken the trouble to go and ask those who gave the information to the British Government, "Please help us to identify who this gentleman is, who, sitting in London, was trying to do all these types of things and who ultimately had to go to Latvia to purchase these arms"?

4.00 P.M.

They were told that it was going to be in Pakistan. I cannot—I say it *prima facie*—escape the feeling that these arms were meant to be supplied to some group in India, a group whom the Indian Government does not wish to prosecute or punish or identify; otherwise, this is a miserable manner in whcih any honest and efficient investigation should go on. As an experienced lawyer of some standing, I know perfectly well how an investigation in this matter should go on. The manner in which this investigation is going on leaves no kind of confidence in the investigation.

I have great respect for my friend from West Bengal. I know that there is a long-standing political dispute between Anand Marg and the West Bengal Government. Who is right and who is wrong, I don't wish to go into it. Everybody knows that these Anand Margis dig a skull from the graveyard and do the *Tandava* dance. They did not need the kind of arms which are mentioned in this informaion. The kind of arms which are mentioned in this information are 2,500 AK-47 Rifles and 15,00,000 rounds of ammunition of Chinese make. It is obvious that Anand Marg for its activities, however misguided and however much you may disagree with them, don't need this kind of arms under any circumstances. Your own information is that this was meant for a group which wanted to rebel against the Government. I have not the slightest doubt that neither the West Bengal Government nor the Central Government, if they are a Government at all, are prepared to tell the nation seriously that the Anand Margis were prepared any rebellion and an act of war on such a grand scale that they were requiring this kind of cache of arms. It is obviously not so. To me it is obvious that they know perfectly well for whom these arms are meant. They now want to divert the investigation into other channels. I would like to ask this from the hon. Home Minister. I come to para 14 of his statement. This report comes three months after the investigation started. The investigation started on the 17th December and 17th of March is coming. After three months the report says:

"The investigation, so far, indicates that the fire arms were meant to be received by certain Anand Margis. The Anand Margis who were arrested in this very serious offence—it is so serious an offence that under TADA this would be planning a war this would be planning a rebellion and even under the Indian Penal Code, no court in this country will release these people on bail yet all these persons were released on bail. It means that you did not have an iota of evidence against these people. After three months this kind of a corrupt investigation you come to the House and solemnly tell the House that it is the Anand Margis who *prima facie* are involved. Somebody is involved and you don't want to name that somebody. You know perfectly well who that somebody is. That is my *prima facie* impression upon the nature of the investigation in this case.

Now I come to Para 9 of the statement. It says:

> "Questioning of an accused disclosed that a conspiracy was hatched in Bangkok in September, 1995 to supply a consignment of fire arms in India."

Sir, questioning of an accused means that some accused has at least got into a mood to confess the truth. If a person confesses the truth he will also tell you who employed him and for whom the arms were meant. Nothing is to be found except that it has been disclosed that a conspiracy was hatched at Bangkok to supply a consignment of fire arms in India. What is new about it? There is nothing new. It shows that even the interrogation of the accused in custody is being done with kid gloves. You are only trying to get some patches of information from them, which you don't want to pass on to the unfortunate people of this country who know

noting about the truth, who have no means of discovering the truth. You want to derail the entire investigation that has taken place in this case.

In Para 14 they say that they have evidence of their involvement.

If you had said that we suspect them, I can understand. If you have any evidence, you must present the evidence to the megistrate who released these people on bail. Did you oppose the bail? Did you present that evidence to the court? Have you gone back to the court and asked for cancellation of their bail if you did not have evidence before and you got the evidence only afterwards?

Have you done all these things? Do you have evidence of their being involved in this huge offence?

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: The bail application was opposed.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Will you give us a copy of the document? It is a public document. I want to see what you have told the court.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Why did the Government not proceed to the higher court for cancellation of the bail order?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Why did you not? It is quite obvious that for the sake of fulfilling the proceedings, you arrested some people for the time being. You did not oppose their bail. I would like to be satisfied that you seriously opposed the bail. If the magistrate countered your submission, you should have gone to the highest court and got the bail cancelled. You should have fought in the Supreme Court. You keep fighting in other cases where the fight is uncalled for. You should have done it in this case where the security of the country was doubtlessly involved. This is very important. The Minister claims that his system was so efficient—this is in paragraph 15—that it ultimately did respond in identifying the aircraft. This is a joke. This sounds like a joke to me. The plane crosses from one end of India to another, it succeeds in fulfilling its mission and then it proceeds to Phuket. The persons who were flying the plane had so much contempt for our efficiency that they thought that it would be worthwhile going back and having some fun.

Why did they come back? I want to know why they came back. Has the Home Minister got some tentative theory in his mind? If the CBI does not know how to investigate cases, please send them to a man of experience. You should learn how to investigate these cases. You should take this House into confidence. Why did these people come back after they had fulfilled their mission? This sounds like a joke to me. Will the Home Minister tell us whether he himself was exercised over this? After fulfilling the mission, after dropping arms, why did these people return? How is it that the key figures who were on the plane, one by one, disappeared? One went away from Calcutta. Another disappeared from Madras. Even from the Bombay airport, the key man disappeared. According to me the country is not safe in the hands of such an incompetent Government and the sooner it goes the better. Will the Home Minister assure me that he is going to resign?

SHRI G.G. SWELL (MEGHALAYA): The letter of the Joint Secretary to the West Bengal Government mut be laid on the Table of the House and copies should be given to us.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): It has already been laid.

DR. B.B. DUTTA (NOMINATED): Mr. Vice-chairman, Sir, the matter which is being debated, discussed, now is very serious indeed. Therefore, I would like to confine myself to certain aspects which are objective and that is exactly the advice given by the Deputy Chairman before the Motion was taken up for discussion that it should be given objectivity. I share the concern of the Members who have spoken before me. Certain lapses, certain lacunae and certain lack of co-ordination are obviously there and the Government not only need to take action to ensure that such a thing will not happen again but also should go into full investigation as to how such a thing did happen. On this, I share the concern of the Members who have spoken. Now, the first thing in this matter is the functioning of the Intelligence. When such a huge quantum of arms and ammunitions could be dropped in such a bold manner, transporting them by plane from one country to another, to my mind, those who had sent it have not done it for the first time. Naturally, these people were engaged earlier also in dumping weapons by other methods.

Otherwise, they would not have been so bold overnight to send weapons to a targetted area in such a bold manner. Now, what was the Intelligence doing? Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I have found one thing. If you just go through the history of the Intelligence cases, whenever anything happened, the Intelligence only came up with the theory that we did alert the agency. Even if we go through the history of the British India, there are famous cases like the Chittagong Armoury raid by the revolutionaries. Even at that time, the Intelligence Agency came up to justify how they had advance information. It is the same tradition of the Intelligence which is continuing. What they have placed before the Houe is badly worded and it covers up a lot of things. It can be twisted and interpreted to mean that yes they did alert us. In this case, of course, they did alert, but the slackness, as usual, is there. If our Intelligence was alert, then my feeling is that this massive dropping, which has taken place through a very well-established network—network at the receiving-end and network from the sender's end—must have been planned for months and years. Otherwise, it could not have materialised. How could it happen is the question. As Members of Parliament, I think, we need to know this. I cannot act as a CBI man. I cannot act as an Intelligence agency. I cannot do the job which the CBI has done. But it is within our jurisdiction to ask what has gone wrong in this country about the Intelligence. We know of many cases where the Intelligence, be it the Home Intelligence or the Defence Intelligence, has been taken by surprise. Now, this is one question. Secondly, once the Intelligence get the information,—in this particular case, they had some information and they did pass it on—then, there is the question of communicating it to the concerned agency. Here, we found that the manner in which it was communicated and the substantive content of the message fell short of discharging the responsibilities correctly.

Here we want to ensure that as and when the intelligence agencies get some information, they are able to convey it to other agencies which are expected to swing into action. This is also a lapse.

My second question is about co-ordination. Some information was available after something had already happened, but I don't know whether there is co-ordination among the various Departments and agencies concerned whose services are called for immediately. The arms dropping incident took place in the early morning of 18th in Purulia, but the meeting of the concerned agencies, the DGCA, the Defence authorities, the CBI authorities, etc., could be held as late as on 21st. But before the incident, the Civil Aviation authorities were alerted. Then the question is: Why was the aircraft not asked to forceland in the Madras Airport? It is because the Madras Airport was not alerted. They did not know anything about it. If the Civil Aviation authorities were not given the information by the Indian Air Force, it would not have known anything. When such tings happen, proper co-ordination among the agencies involved is very essential. In the Bombay Airport, Mr. Kim Davy said that he was going to deposit the fee for the aircraft which was grounded. This is a fantastic explanation because nobody pays a fee for a grounded aircraft. How could that question be raised? Let is be the Defence officials, let it be the civil Aviation authorities, whoever it is, they were not able to make a joint effort. Even after the happening they were not able to join together and take a well co-ordinated action. These are questions which we would like to put to the hon. Home Minister who is sitting here. He should satisfy us as to what has gone wrong. If something has gone wrong at some point and somewhere, he should tell us with what speed the investigation is being carried out. He should also give us an assurance that the persons who where fund guilty would be punished expeditiouly so that such an action would become exemplary because the incident involves the defence of the country. The citizens of this country have to be assured that they are being protected. In the eastern sector, so many things are going wrong. The people who are living in the periphery of the country, in the eastern sector of the country should be made to feel that the Government, the administration, the Defence Department, etc., are able to give them a sence of confidence, that they are able to protect their lives and properties which are at stake. The arms dropping incident took place in that sector. One day there may be a civil war. There may take place riots. If such things happen, you would not know which group is doing, what it is doing and in what direction it is doing. You would not be able to know. This

is all which I want to tell the hon. Home Minister.

Finally, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, a veteran Parliamentarian, an ever-eloguent Parliamentarian, made a very serious charge against the hon. Home Minister. He said that the statement by the hon. Home Minister was a spurious statement. He went on to say that the Centre was in collusion with those people for whom the arms were sent and he sought to justify the charge. He quoted from a letter written by a Joint Secretary in the Ministry of Home Affairs. He adduced some other evidence also. I take very serious exception to his charge on several counts.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, whenever we discuss something in Parliament, we should discuss it with an objective spirit. But we often find that things are politically twisted very quickly. At once we mount a barrage against criticise the Home Minister or the Prime Minister and demand their resignations. Now we are discussing the arms dropping incident. And it is a very serious incident. When we are discussing the issue, we must examine the lapses committed by various agencies and we must ensure that corrective action is taken. Being a responsible Parliamentarian, a very senior Parliamentarian at that, he made such a fantastic charge that the Home Minister had made a false statement in the House.

Now, how can the hon. Home Minister of India ever make a false statement in the House? There is nothing false about it. What is false about it, I do not know. The hon. Member has said that there was information that this consignment was being despatched to the State of West Bengal with the avowed objective of over-throwing the Communist Government there, that the agency which has received the arms, which is the Ananda Margis, who have already been caught, are definitely the one group of people who have received arms—there may be other end-users, we do not know because the investiation is going on—and that, they are going to establish the Hindu Raj and that the Centre is in collusion. Now, why such a hasty inference should be made just because there was a lack of corrdination? For lack of corrdination, we must aim at the correct points, rather than involving the Home Minister or the Prime Minister or the entire Government. All of us know that such lapses have been occurring in our country. It has become a culture in this country. We are over-democratic. We are over-iberal. Everyting is open. Anybody can come and anybody can go. That happened in West Bengal. Mr. K.R. Malkani was telling us that he, along with two other Members of Parliament, visited that spot. What had happened in West Bengal? When they were there at that spot in Purulia District, they asked the Police Superintendent, "Are you able to address yourself to the situation? Are you able to collect the arms and all these things?" He said, "No. I don't have adequate police force. I have got only 38 policemen". He told this to the three hon. MPs who visited that spot. He said, "I am not equal to this task. I am terribly short of forces" But when of the Home Secretary from Delhi, offered The Chief Secretary West Bengal forces, saying "I would offer as many CRPF men or other para-military forces as you want; you tell me, I can send them forthwith so that sufficient combing operations can be done thoroughly and whatever arms are still there can be recovered". The Chief Secertary said, "No, no. I am fully equipped. I have got enough policement. I don't reguire your help. My police force is doing a wonderful job".

SHRI MD. SALIM: What is your source of information? If you please, disclose that.

DR. B.B. GUPTA: Source of information? The way you have collected some information, in the same way... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: On what basis are you saying this? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MD. SALIM: you are casting aspersions on the Home Secretary and the Chief Secretary of West Bengal, who are not present here. On what basis? (*Interruptions*)

DR. B.B. DUTTA: It is not an allegation. It is the telephonic conversation between them. You find it out whether it is a fact or not. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: No. You are differing from the observations made in the statement... (*Interruptions*)

What is the basis of your analysis? (Interruptions)

SHRI MD. SALIM: the statement is here, certifying the West Bengal Government's operation... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI G.G. SWELL: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, was this letter brought to the attention of the Home Minister before they sent it? Did he see this letter before it was sent to West Bengal? Were you aware of it and what action did you take? It is a serious letter and it could not have gone without the Home Minister being brought into the picture.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): He would reply to it later. Please sit down.

DR. B.B. DUTTA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta also said that the cadre people at the grassroot level in the village, the party people, have done a wonderful job because they have given a helping hand in recovering the arms. Now, I take serious exception to this on one ground, on the ground principle, that we sould not normally allow the civilians to handle such sophisticated arms like the AK-47 rifles and other things. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: What are you talking? They gave information that somebody is dropping... (*Interruptions*)

DR. B.B. DUTTA: They gave information, but they collected.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MD. SALIM: Why do you treaton a par the lower-level activists with the Left activists.....(*Interruptions*)

DR. B.B. DUTTA: I am not equating. (*Interruptions*)

I am not suspecting. (*Interruptions*) Why are you so concerned about it? (*Interruptions*) I am saying, in principle it is not good. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: They just found out that illegally arms have been dropped and they passed on the information to the relevant security agencies... (*Interruptions*)

DR. B.B. DUTTA: The fact remains that.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: I do not understand what you are saying. The villagers took the arms and handed them over to the police...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI G.G. SWELL: We congratulate the people of Purulia, the poor villagers who were aware of it, who took the arms and informed the police while the entire Government was not aware of it...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. B.B. DUTTA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I want to know why some arms and ammunition and particularly AK-47 rifles were missing from there. The number of AK-47 rifles and the number of other weapons which had been sent, all have not been accounted for ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOPTAL BASU: Dr. Dutta, I can also raise this question. The Home Minister says that for the first time after Independence this has happened. This is the first time that we know that this has happened. Because the manner in which it has happened, it has been detected for the first time. We do not know how many such cases have gone undetected. Do not argue like that. It will create difficulty for you...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. B.B. DUTTA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, they are misunderstanding the whole thing. I say that on principle in any State, be it Congress-ruled, be it Communist ruled or any other party-ruled, the civilian people should not be given access to hand such type of arms even if they have been dropped...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Because those arms were dropped there...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. B.B. DUTTA: Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta said that his cadres had collected the arms...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: If your party is not there, we cannot help it...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MD. SALIM: If such incidents take place in North-East, whether your party rules in Nagaland or in Mizoram -- I am not blaming -- are you in a position that your people in the grassroot level mobilise the entire masses and collect this type of cache.

DR. B.B. DUTTA: There are so many parties. Some parties will go...(*Interruptions*)... But the police should do their duty to see that...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: That has been appreciated by the hon. Home Minister ...(*Interruptions*)...They should also play a role,..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MD. SALIM: His argument is that something more is still left. How do you make out the left out? You have definite information as to how many arms had been dropped.

DR. B.B. DUTTA: That is the information available with the people. The investigation is going on and that is the definite information available...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Where is that information?

...(*Interruptions*)...Let the hon. Home Minister tell us...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: The charge is that he is not sharing the information ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Dr. Dutta, there are many more speakers after you. You are unnecessarily dragging on a non-issue. Under the Constitution, the citizens have a duty, under the Cr. P.C. also, every citizen has a duty to inform the police. They are duty-bound to inform the police. That is all...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. B.B DUTTA: Sir, I want to lay emphasis on one more point. It is clear that the Anand Margis are the recipients, but our hunch is this. I come from the North-East where a lot of extremist and underground activities are going on. They have selected an area in the eastern region of the country and we do not know from where they get aircraft, where they halt it and from where they get arms and ammunition. All these indicate that the whole eastern region is very badly affected by arms smuggling. In fact, we have got some private information that there are not only Anand Margis, but also other organisations. These organisations are active in the North-East and West Bengal. I do not know for what purpose they are amassing a large quantity of arms and ammunition. I ask the Home Minister to tell our security agencies to find out how many other organisations are already possessing arms. It is not a new thing which has been detected just now. These organisations have been receiving it. There are not only Anand Margis, but also other organisations. All these things should be found out forthwith, otherwise, with the kind of situation which is developing in the North-East and in the neighbouring areas, one day you will find that the whole area may be out of your control. Thank you.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सतीश अग्रवाल) : श्री रामगोपाल यादव। आप थोड़ा समय का ध्यान रखिए और जो मुख्य मुद्दा है उस पर ध्यान केंद्रित करिए तो ज्यादा अच्छा भाषण होगा।

श्री रामगोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, आपको कभी घंटी नहीं बजानी पड़ेगी।

महोदय, माननीय गृह मंत्री जी जब अपना वक्तव्य पढ़ रहे थे तो कई तरह के प्रश्न मेरे मन में आ रहे थे। लेकिन जब गुरूदास दासगुप्त जी ने गृह मंत्रालय के एक संयुक्त सचिव का पत्र पढ़ कर सुनाया तो जो आए दिन चर्चा रहती है कि देश की सुरक्षा को खतरा है उस आशंका से मेरा मन भर उठा। मान्यवर, जब देश के बाहर कई शक्तियां इस देश को खंडित करने के लिए निन्तर षडयंत्र कर रही हैं उस वक्त इतनी गंभीर घटना की पूर्व जानकारी होने के बावजूद कोई तात्कालिक कार्यवाही न हो, कोई प्रिवेंटिव एक्शन न हो इससे ज्यादा खतरनाक और कोई बात नहीं हो सकती है। सारी दुनिया जानती है कि कभी-कभी किन्हीं देशों के पार्ट पर अगर कोई मामूली भी गलती हो तो लोगों को बहुत ज्यादा उसका नुकसान उठाना पड़ा। मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय गृह मंत्री जी और सारे सदन के लोगों को याद दिलाना चाहूंगा 1968 में एक दिन ऐसा था जब मिस्र के राष्ट्रपति नासिर और सीरिया इन दोनों देशों ने मिलकर यह योजना बनाई थी कि इस्राइल के खिलाफ एक ऐसी कार्यवाही की जाए कि इसको नष्ट कर दिया जाए। जरा सी लापरवाही या एक त्यौहार की वजह से थोड़ा विलम्ब हुआ, सारे एअरफोर्स के विमान हवाई अड्डे पर हमला करने के लिए खड़े थे, लेकिन इसाइल की खुफिया एजेंसी को पता चल गया और आप जानते हैं कि दो घंटे के अंदर इस्राइल ने सीरिया और मिस्र दोनों के एअरपोर्ट्स को खत्म कर दिया और 72 घंटे के अंदर सिनाई पेनिनजुला और गोलान हाइट्स पर कब्जा कर लिया, जो कि आज तक उसको वापस लेने में दिक्कत हो रही है। जब देश की सुरक्षा के लिए इतनी लापरवाही होगी तो मुझे याद आता है, डा. राधाकृष्णन ने एक बार कहा था,

The only thing we learn from history is that we learn nothing from it.

मैं इस अवसर पर ज्यादा कुछ नहीं कहना चाहूंगा केवल दो सवाल माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से करना चाहूंगा कि क्या गृह मंत्रालय के अधिकारियों ने 17 दिसंबर से पहले जो जानकारी प्राप्त हुई थी वह माननीय गृह मंत्री जी की जानकारी में लाई गई? अगर यह जानकारी में लाई गई थी तो क्या बम्बई और बनारस की एअर पोर्ट्स अथारिटीज़ को एलर्ट किया गया था? अगर एलर्ट किया गया था तो इसके बावजूद वह विमान बम्बई और बनारस में उतरा तो संबंधित अधिकारियों के खिलाफ या गृह मंत्रालय के उन अधिकारियों के खिलाफ जिन्होंने लापरवाही की है, क्या कोई कार्यवाही अभी तक हुई? सिर्फ ये सवाल मैं जानना चाहूंगा। अन्य सारी बातें लोगों ने कह दी हैं, केवल एक बात मैं यह और कहना चाहूंगा।

मुझे सबसे ज्यादा दुख इस बात का भी है कि देश की सुरक्षा का चाहे कितना ही गंभीर मसला हो, जब इस सदन में कोई चर्चा होती है तो यह बहुत दुखद चीज़ है कि हर मामले को पोलिटीकल एंगल दे दिया जाता है। यह बहुत दुखद चीज़ है। पश्चिम बंगाल की पुलिस ने और पुरूलिया के लोगों ने प्रशंसनीय कार्य किया, उसको भी खींचने की कोशिश नहीं की जानी चाहिए।

That was a commendable job on the part of the people of Purulia and the police of West Bengal

लेकिन इसको भी पोलिटीकल एंगल से देखा जाएगा। यह अच्छी चीज़ नहीं है। धन्यवाद।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. John F. Fernandes, Mr. Fernandes, be short and brief.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): I will be very brief....(*Interruptions*)....I will be very brief.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Ultimately you are speaking on behalf of the Government; the Home Minister is here to reply....(*Interruptions*)....

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Sir, you have heard this from the Opposition benches ....(*Interruptions*).... I will be very brief.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, we are debating a very serious matter. The question is not whether it is the Central Government which failed or whether it is the State Government which failed. It will not be appropriate in this House to score debating points over the Treasury benches or the Opposition benches. The crux of the problem is that there was a national security failure. It was a grave matter for the nation. The hon. Home Minister in his statement has mentioned that this is for the first time that there has been such a case. I think it is for the first time that a case has been identified and the arms were partially seized. Sir, we have the intelligence agencies, we have the internal intelligence agency, the Intelligence Bureau. We have also the external intelligence agency, RAW. It took three months for the conspiracy to be hatched. In September 1993 it was hatched in Bangkok. Then it surfaced in Europe on 15th of November, as per the information available. The Interpol also informed the Government of India. We have to be ashamed because the system in our country has miserably failed. I do not want to refer to the letter which was sent by post. It would have been appropriate on the part of the gentleman concerned, the Joint Secretary, to send this sensitive information by a courier. We know how our mail, the diplomatic mail, goes from this country to foreign countries. I do not know why this channel was sought. Let us not point accusing fingers at each other. We have to see that the system is geared up. Sir, with the liberalised policy, open-sky policy, we have also allowed air-taxi operators and most of these planes are foreign planes. They are on lease; either wet lease or dry lease. There is an example from Tel Aviv. Sir, when we wanted an Air India flight from Bombay to Tel Aviv, that Government raised objections and said that Air India would not be permitted to operate lease aircraft. Here we had information that a plane was coming from Karachi International Airport, sought permission to land not at the International Airport of Delhi, which was *en route*, not at the Calcutta Airport, but at a smaller airport at Varanasi. So, Sir, I think we had a lot of time to act and to react. I feel it is a total failure of the intelligence agencies of the country. Let us not blame the bureaucrats; let us not blame the politicians and the Ministers. I do not know what the technocrats are doing; what the intelligence agencies are doing. Sir, it is not the first incident that such a thing has happened. We read some reports that in Cochin a French yatch entered into our territory and they were just measuring the depth of the naval base. I think we have to be ashamed of our system because there is a total failure of the security of this country. I do not know what has been done in that case also because there are reports that a gentleman from Goa is involved, a so-called 'captain' from Goa is linked with some Minister in my State. This Minister has visited Singapore for a similar conspiracy. He was interviewed by the Intelligence Bureau. The information leaked out is that this 'captain' has already confessed that he transferred a lot of dollars. He passed on rupees from here to Singapore and the dollars purchased with that money were passed on to London for certain beneficiaries. I do not know how this money is flowing back in to this country. Whether it is in the form of arms or whether it is in the form of gold, it is for the hon. Minister to investigate.

Sir, again I do not know whether the Joint Secretary had alerted the DGCA. If the DGCA had been made aware that there was a conspiracy, I do not think they would have given any permission for this aircraft to land at a certain place or a certain airfield. I also do not know whether the DGCA in return asked about the content of the cargo of the plane. I also do not know whether the DGCA went to the airport at Varanasi to check the cargo. I do not know whether these formalities had been gone through or not. I think it was not done for obvious reasons because it was reported in the Press that when this plane was force-landed in Bombay, Kim P. Davy just walked out. He walked out by dishing out some notes to so many officers at the airport. That is how he escaped from the airport. It is mentioned in the statement given by the Minister that all these people were detained. If these people were detained then how could this gentlemen walk out without any security escort? So, I think, Sir, it is time for introspection. Again about the RDX landing in Bombay, in the Bombay blasts, you know how it came to this country. You know this was abetted and helped by the customs officials who have been suspended now. Therefore, I say, Sir, that it is a total system failure, a human failure. I think it would be appropriate for us to reconsider our intelligence agency. We know the I.B. is under the Home Ministry, we know the RAW is under the Cabinet Secretariat and the CBI is under the PMO. I do not think there is proper coordination in this country. So it is high time we had a central security agency in this country to coordinate all these efforts. Sir, I do not want to go into details, I being the last speaker. Most of the points have been covered by my colleagues. But I would like the hon. Home Minister to react on this. Again, Sir, in para 6 the Minister has mentioned that the CBI went to assist the police in West Bengal. The CBI has no statutory power to act anywhere in the country. They have to go and talk to the State Government, get the permission of the State Government. Earlier I had mentioned to the hon. Home Minister that we have to have a force, a federal force to go and investigate any national security aspect in any part of the country. Now the Government of Kerala is demanding that the CBI should take over the investigation of the submarine espionage case. So I do not think it will be possible to solve our security problem unless we have a full powered federal police agency to go into this matter. I hope the hon. Home Minister will react to my queries.

SHRI V. P. DURAISAMY (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Vice-Chairman Sir, it is a sad and shocking news to know that on the 17th of December 1995 around midnight a plane flew at a low level and dropped 300 parachutes containing weapons. After knowing about the incident, the entire people of the village immediately brought it to the notice of the very nearest police station. We understand the weapons were AK-47 rifles, pistols and rockets. I think the origin of these weapons could not be traced by our Intelligence agencies but they may have been manufactured in Hungary, Romania, Germony, China, Finland, North Korea and Egypt. But at the same time I do not want to blame any country. We do not know so far which country has transferred these weapons to India, through whom, who was employed, under whose instruction it has taken place. That we are not in a position to say. Just a few minutes back our senior hon. Member Shri Ram Jethmalani said that the investigation is incomplete. Under these circumstances we are not in a position to say under whose instructions, through whom the arms have been dropped in the Purulia area. Some papers also say that the main suspects are the Anand Margis. I understand the Anand Margis' headquarters is very near to Purulia area. That is why the suspicion falls on the Anand Margis whose headquarters is very near the drop-zone. These people have plenty of money. When my friend Shri Narayanasamy was speaking he shifted the ruling party's responsibility on to the shoulders of the West Bengal Government. I could not agree with Shri Narayanasamy's shifting of the responsibility to the State Government.

It is a vital point, it involves the national security and integrity. Just shifting the responsibility on to any Government won't serve any purpose. Many senior Members have given a clear picture about what the Central Government should do immediately. The CBI has identified two major suspects—one Indian Passport holder from Bangalore, Satya Narayan Gowda *alias* Randy and another Hong Kong based Indian with a Singapore Passport, Daya M. Anand. We want to know what the history

is of these two persons. What were their past activities inside the country or outside the country? We want to know this from the hon. Home Minister. We also want to know from the Government whether they have taken any action through CBI or other intelligence agencies or BSF against Satya Narayan Gowda *alias* Randy and Daya M. Anand.

I was expecting from Mr. Narayanasamy, who accused the CPM Government, that he would say something special about Tamil Nadu. Purulia has become very prominent, very popular nowadays in the newspapers because of the arms dropping. But in Tamil Nadu, in the coastal area, people in half-a-dozen districts are always under a threat. The Government of India knows very well; the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu is under "Z" category protection. The Central Government also provided ... (*Interruptions*). The Government of India has also provided sufficient protection to the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu. In the coastal area, we have got the LTTE problem. Our chief Minister who is under "Z' category, has taken stern action and firm action to curg the LTTE to root it out, to eradicate it by all means. I hope the hon. Home Minister also will help the Tamil Nadu Government, without any discrimination, in giving full security to the citizens of India, and the people of Tamil Nadu in particular. We requested an amount of Rs. 100 crores for modernisation of the police force in Tamil Nadu and also to get modern weapons to face the problem of the LTTE. But, the Government of India has given only Rs. 10 crores.

While talking about Purulia, many of our friends, our elder Members have said about the international security. But, in Tamil Nadu, our fishermen community are daily meeting troubles. Daily they have to go to the sea for fishing, and they are being murdered by the LTTE people—Here, in Purulia, we came to know that the arms have been dropped on the 17th alone. But in the coastal area of Tamil Nadu, in more than half-a-dozen districts, the LTTE people are exporting arms to Tamil Nadu everyday and disturbing peace there. Therefore, I would demand that in order to protect the fishermen community and other people in the coastal districts of Tamil Nadu from the LTTE menace, the Central Government should provide Rs. 100 crores to the Tamil Nadu Government for the purpose of modernisation of our police force, for equipping them with modern weapons.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. Duraisamy, you are supposed to seek clarifications on the statement made by the Home Minister. But you are now pleading the case of granting additional assistance to the Tamil Nadu Government for modrnisation of its police force.

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: Tamil Nadu is also within India, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): All right; but we are not discussing that. We are focussing only on Purulia.

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: I would be failing in my duty if I do not refer to this aspect.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Any other questions you would like to ask?

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: I am coming to the point.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): After ten minutes, you are coming to the point!

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: Yes.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Tamil Nadu is half-way from Purulia.

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: First Tamil Nadu and then India.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): You deserve to be in Government because Government also comes to the point after a long time .

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: Sir, my point is, harmonious Centre-State relations are very essential for the security of India. There is no point in the Centre accusing the States, or, the States accusing the Centre. There should be a harmonious relationship between the Centre and the States, from the point of view of the integrity of the nation.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Thank you very much.

SHRI V.P. DURAISAMY: The nation should be protected at any cost. As Members of the Rajya Sabha, we are entitled to know as to what action has been taken by the Government of

India to curb such activities. We would like to know as to what action has been taken to apprehend the persons who are still at large. What progress has been made in this case? What action the Government is taking to prevent the recurrence of such incidents in future?

Thank you.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR (Nominated): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I will not take much time. I would only refer to some points which have been missed out.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): That is much better. Why should you unnecessarily repeat things.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR: Otherwise, you would start ringing the bell.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): You should be as brief in your speech as Babasaheb Ambedkar was.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR: He spoke for more than one-and-a-half hours, I think.

Sir, the issue of security has not come up just today. This is an issue which has been there right from the day of Independence. It was during the British period that an intelligence officer who was with the British went over to Pakistan. It is from that period that we are having this whole system of parallel intelligence agencies running in this country.

Time and again, arms and ammunition have been smuggled into this country. It has either been through the land route or the sea route earlier. We have now discovered that the air now route is also being used for this purpose.

I would like to know from the hon. Home Minister as to what action has been taken to identify those persons who are there with the British Intelligence, who are operating under the British Intelligence. That is the root of the issue. Unless we identify those persons who are working with the British Intelligence, who are going on recruting people to be part of that intelligence system, who pass on intelligence information to their chief who, in turn, passes it on to Pakistan, we would not be able to get at the root of the problem. I think if we address ourselves to this aspect, we would have found answers to the various questions, including the one raised by Mr. John Fernandes in regard to RDX. So far, we have not been able to identify even the route through which the RDX explosives came into Bombay. Secondly, I would like to refer to the Vohra Committee Report. The Vohra Committee Report is nothing but a collection of information together, gathering of information lying in the files of the different intelligence agencies. Sir, this is not the first time when we have come to know that some conspiracy has been going on. Even in the case of Rajiv Gandhi, the conspiracy was detected some three months before. Even in this case, it is my information that the conspiracy was detected nearly two months before. It was published in one of the Blue Books which was given to the intelligence people. If it was given to the Intelligence Department, it has to be in the knowledge of every State Intelligence Department that something is happening. What was written in the letter is exactly what existed in the Blue Book and what was circulated. I want to know from the Home Minister whether you are going to have some sort of a coordinating agency for these agencies, where all information collected can be pooled together. The Vohra Committee Report has not been published. Some information is hidden, but it is available in the market. The only thing is that nobody is able to say a word because nobody has proof for it. I know many things but I cannot mention them only because there is no proof for them.I think the proof is lying with the Home Ministry.

I am saying this because a political leader from Maharashtra—I will not mention his name—has been saying for the last six months, and he has mentioned it in one interview also, that in 1997 we might have a civil war in this country. He is a leader of repute. There is nothing to doubt his integrity. He has been saying it in public meetings. He has been saying it in Press conferences. He has even given an interview about it. I would not like to give his name. The Home Minister is aware of it.

SHRI MD. SALIM: You may mention the State from which he comes.

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR: The leader is coming from my State. ... (*Interruptions*)

That is what he has said. He has gone on record. If he has gone on record, I want to know whether the Home Minister or anybody else has had a word with him. After all, on what basis is he saying that there is going to be a civil war? The ammunition coming into this country is very large. Today, even the Konkan belt is being used for bringing in arms. A very large number of arms are available. They are available in plenty in Delhi. AK-47 is also available.

I want to know whether they are going to take a look at this aspect from the angle of security of this country and whether the Home Minister is going to take the House into confidence on the action they are going to take if the reports which they have are true.

Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Thank you very much, Mr. Prakash.

Mr. Kohli, the Deputy Chairman has permitted you. So, I am requesting you to ask only a few questions and not to make a speech.

श्री ओ. पी. कोहली (दिल्ली): महोदय, मैं केवल प्रश्नों तक ही अपने को सीमित रखूंगा। मेरे प्रश्न इस प्रकार हैं। क्या सरकार को पुरूलिया में हथियार डाले जाने की घटना घटित होने से पहले इस बात की पूर्व जानकारी थी या नहीं। और यदि थी तो उसने उसे गम्भीरता से क्यों नहीं लिया और एहतियाती कार्यवाही क्यों नहीं की।

मेरा दूसरा प्रश्न यह है कि अब तक की जाँच के आधार पर गिराये गये हथियारों की अनुमानित मात्रा कितनी है और बरामद किए गए हथियारों की मात्रा में और गिराये गये हथियारों की मात्रा में कितना अन्तर है?

मेरा तीसरा प्रश्न यह है कि जो हथियार बरामद नहीं किए जा सके, वे हथियार अब तक की जांच के आधार पर किनके हाथ में हैं? वे पुरूलिया के लोगों के हाथ में हैं, वे बंगाल के उन क्षेत्रों के लोगों के हाथ में हैं, वे बिहार के लोगों के हाथ में हैं, वे क्रिमनलों के हाथ में हैं, वे इनसरजैंट ग्रुप्स के हाथ में हैं या वे इनफिल्ट्रर्स के हाथ में हैं। अब तक की जानकारी के आधार पर क्या मिलता है?

मेरा अगला प्रश्न है कि बम्बई हवाई अड्डे पर जहाज के लेंडिंग करने से पहले बम्बई पुलिस को सूचना दी गई थी या लेंडिंग होने के बाद सूचना दी गई थी? यदि बाद में सूचना दी गई थी तो कितने घंटे बाद सूचना दी गई थी?

एक मेरा प्रश्न और है कि किम देवी का हमारे देश में दर्जनों लोगों के साथ सम्पर्क और संबंध बना हुआ हैं, ऐसा खबरों से लगता हैं यह जो किम देवी का देश के भीतर बहुत से लोगों से, चाहे वह हथियारों का व्यापार करते हों, चाहे तस्कर हों, चाहे क्रिमिनल हों, सम्पर्क सूत्र की जांच के आधार पर सरकार को जो जानकारी मिली है वह मंत्री जी संसद के साथ शेयर करें लो यह उचित होगा।

मेरा अगली प्रश्न है कि पुरूलिया और झालदा के बीच फासला कितना है? हथियार रात को 11 बजे गिराए गए। पुलिस घटनास्थल पर कब पहुंची? पुलिस का देर से पहुंचने का क्या एक्सप्लेनेशन है, क्या स्पष्टीकरण है?

मेरा अगला प्रश्न यह है कि कैप्टन ने अपनी फ्लाइट का जब प्लान बदला तो उस समय एअर अथारिटी को शक क्यों नहीं हुआ? वाराणसी से कलकत्ता पहुंचने में सामान्यत: जितना समय लगता है, उससे ज्यादा देरी लगी तो हवाई अधिकारियों को इस बारे में सन्देह क्यों नहीं हुआ? फिर रंगून और कुवैत के हवाई अधिकारियों से हमारे हवाई अधिकारियों ने पूछताछ क्यों नहीं की?

महोदय, कुल मिलाकर गृह मंत्री जी ने जो वक्तव्य दिया है वह, पुरलिया कांड के बारे लोगों में जितनी जिज्ञासायें हैं, जितनी शंकायें हैं उनका समाधान नहीं करता, संतोष नहीं देता बल्कि यह कई प्रकार के सवाल खड़ा करता हैं पुरूलिया में हथियार गिराये जाने की घटना ने हमारी इंटेलीजेंस एजेंसी और सिविल एवियेशन तंत्र के काम करने के तरीके पर एक गंभीर सवाल खड़ा कर दिया है। इस घटना से राष्ट्रीय सुरक्षा के बारे में सरकार की लापरवाही, उपेक्षापूर्ण रवैया और उसका निकम्मापन भी उजागर हुआ है। इस घटना से पूरे देश को स्तब्ध कर दिया है और आज पूरे देश में यह महसूस किया जा रहा है कि इस करकार के हाथ में हमारे देश की सुरक्षा सुरक्षित नहीं हैं। मैं चाहूंगा कि गृह मंत्री जी इन प्रश्नों का उत्तर दे जो प्रश्न मैंने उठाए हैं।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): I have received a request from Mr. Parag Chaliha. He wants to ask questions. Kindly be brief Mr. Chaliha and do not repeat anything which has already been asked here.

SHRI PARAG CHALIHA (ASSAM): I refer to paragraph 3 of the Minister's Statement: "On receipt of information from the West Bengal Government about the airdrop of arms and ammunition...." It is not clear as to when and at what time this information was received by

the Home Ministry from the West Bengal Government. I want to know clearly about it.

Sir, it is very strange that even after almost three months of the incident -- it is not an incident, but a very severe warning about the inadequacies in our information system and in a very vital aspect of a modern Government, that is, security-nothing much is known.

Sir, Calcutta papers, particularly the Telegraph, have gone very deep into the whole matter and no reference has been made about them. So, I am really at a loss to understand how we can afford to take this whole matter in a very Cavalier way as if nothing has happened. Therefore, I want the Home Minister to clarify on all these issues as to when and what particulr steps have been taken about stopping this sort of nuisance in future and why we have failed so much. It appears that there are some sweet references also about the West Bengal Government. That is all right. But what about some bitter pills about our own failure in the system? I would be glad if the Home Minister clarifies these things in his reply. I got a last point. I forgot the name of a newspaper. It was stated in that newspaper that the British Government had informed the Government of India about this Purulia arms dropping incident. It was stated on the 15th November. If that was the case, why didn't the Government of India take any step to apprehend the persons responsible for it? These things require some clarifications. I would be glad if the Home Minister replies to my points.

(SHRI S.B. CHAVAN): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I must express my gratitude to the hon. Members for postponing the debate on an issue where there was a controversy and they conceded that arms dropping incident in Purulia is a very serious issue confronting our nation and that is why it should receive priority and rightly this issue has been taken up for a discussion in this House. At the very outset, I would like to appeal to all hon. Members that they should not consider this issue as a party issue or an issue of West Bengal Government. I have great respect for Mr. Ram Jethmalani Ji. He prefaced his statement by saying that he was aware of the fact that the CBI had not yet copleted its investigation. The kind of conclusion which he has jumped to does not clearly indicate that he has left anything. The atmosphere is so surcharged, if anything happens in any part of the country everybody would like to say that this head has to go. I think, in fact, that is not a solution to the problem. We have to consider this matter more seriously. There is no denying the fact that this sort of thing has happened for the first time in our country and we would have to look at different aspects of this question and tighten the kind of mechanism which is now available with us so that we do not allow aything of this nature to be repeated again, specially against the background where thee are some forces which, in fact, are working all around our country, who are very much interested in creating destabilisation conditions in India. In that respect,I think, one of the hon. Members has made a reference to what I said. I do not deny what I said in Pune. I suspect that, because a number of things from which we are trying to draw inferences are dependent on the kind of information which has become available after investigations. It is not before that. The information which the British intelligence agency have supplied to us in the beginning was that a small aircraft was going to have a flight via Karachi to somewhere in Myanmar. The destination was supposed to be Bangladesh. This was the kind of information that we had. Later on the plans changed. After changing plans, something different has happened. We have also to understand that after the liberalisation policy which we have adopted, there are about 1,000 to 1,200 flights per day. Everyday there are about 1,000 to 1,200 flights flying over India and halting at different destinations in India. They have taken full advantage of this kind of a situation and thereafter...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: In your own letter the commitment is there that you knew that this aircraft was coming. This specific information you had.

SHRI MD. SALIM: This specific information you were having.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: In fact, there is nothing to hide from you. You can come to me and I would show you the kind of intelligence report that I have. So, the report that this plane was going to drop arms in Purulia was not available, but they had some information about the landing of the plane at that particular point

near Dhanbad. That was the information we had. About this AN-26, the information we got was after full investigation. That information was also available thereafter. I am not denying the fact. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Either you kindly deny that the letter is correct...(*Interruptions*). The letter clearly lays down the entire route-from Lativia, Pakistan, Banaras, everything. And your own letter says that. Either you deny that this letter is correct or you confirm it. If you confirm it, then you had the information.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, our discussions centred around the letter that the Joint Secretary had written. If the letter is genuine, let the hon. Minister say that. I have authenticated it. Let him say whether it is genuine or not. If it is found to be genuine, then as per the letter, the Government of India had the full information. In the first paragraph, it is written that it will land near Dhanbad.In the second paragraph of the letter of the Joint Secretary, it is categorically stated that it will be dropping a consignment of arms in between two hillocks and near a building which will be identified by headlights.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: This is the letter of 12th December. The British intelligence agency's report is much earlier. So, they are different. This, in fact, has been intimated to both the Bihar Government and the West Bengal Government. But I accept the point that, in fact, he should have taken care to see that the postal agency was not utilised irrespective of what the orders were. In fact, it was a serious matter and knowing the postal system as it is working today, I am sure that any person who is responsible would have resorted to some other method by which quick information should have been supplied to both the Governments so that they were able to take advance action in the matter...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Sir, the hon. Minister is evading the issue. The main point is this. I have some idea of how the intelligence works.

श्री एस॰एस॰ अहलुवालिया: यह सारे सवाल उठा चुके है। इस तरह से तो डिवेट खत्म नहीं होगी ...(व्यवधान).....

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: I am speaking with permission. The intelligence works and when the information comes, you filter it through various things, you coordinate it and before you pass it on to the State, you are convinced of that information. The vital date is not 12th. The vital date is when the process of filtration starts. Once you have sorted out the information and you have come to a conclusion, you discharge your responsibility only by writing a lousy letter to the State Government and not taking other actions!

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: Sir, this is not proper. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I am not interrupting. I am only saying this. When he says that the Officer should have taken a little care-in my opinion, it is a serious thing-it is an absolutely light-hearted comment. He will have to accept the responsibility, the repercussions. Therefore, I want to know whether the Officer is going to be seriously indicated for dereliction of duty.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, my question is, ...(*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Just a minute, Mr. Salim. Please take your seat. After all, the Home Minister has just started his reply.You cannot question him on each and every sentence. I permitted Gurudasji and Gujralji just because they wanted to bring him to that particular point. That was permissible.But you cannot question the Home Minister on each and every sentence and then extort something which he may not like to say here. I will give you time at the end of the reply. If you seek certain clarifications, I am here. I will wait for half an hour more. Let him make his speech.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: I was just saying that a large number of flights come to India and halt here.'There are a large number of flights which go from our air space and the destinations happen to be different countries. If there are certain departments which are supposed to be in charge or if they have definite information that certain contraband goods are going, certain arms are going to be dropped, and on that basis,

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

if they feel that here is a case in which they can stop the aircraft, search the same, try to find out as to whether they can register a case against that aircraft and those who are responsible for the same, then they have to be very, very careful. In fact, I have these doubts in my mind also and that is why I have made full enquiry into it to find out whether we can resort to this kind of a method. I was given to understand that this issue had been referred to the Law Ministry for their opinion as to what kind of action we could take on the basis of the information that we got, merely having information is not good enough. We must have information which is unimpeachable, and on which, if by any chance, we are to fail, then, of course, there is a possibility of the aircraft owner or the agency, who is operating the same, suing us for damages. That is why we have got to be very careful. Unless we are on very sure grounds, we cannot possibly take this kind of action. The DGCA peritted this flight to land at Varanasi and Calcutta only for technical reasons. Actually, this was not supposed to be their destination. The destination was somewhere either in Myanmar or Bangladesh-Dhaka. But, somehow, for reasons best known to them, the Myanmar Government did not allow the aircraft to land at Yangoon, which are supposed to be their destination, and later on, they changed the flight plan. There are a large number of things about which it is very difficult for me to give any explanation. I understand that. Unless I get full information, it will not be proper on my part to say that this is correct and this is not correct. At this stage, certain things have been brought to our notice, and on that basis. I have to reply to the debate and I have to say something. Without that, if I say, wait till the entire investigation is complete-might be, for another six or eitht months-we will not be in a position to say anything. Everybody was very eager that something has to be stated on the floor of the House. That is why this attempt has been made. Sir, the point which we have to understand is that the CBI is aready seized of the matter. The CBI is going to enquire into all aspects of this episode.Whether a proper letter was not signed. Whether a proper method was not adopted how Davy, having reached Bombay,could escape from there, the hotels where these people used to stay, even now, they can investigate this aspect of the question and try to find out if the hotel-keeper was informing the authorities concerned about all other foreigners but only in this particular case he has failed in reporting the matter to the authorities concerned-these are all issues with which definitely the CBI officers are concerned and they will look into them. That is why it will be too early for me to say anything on that aspect of the question.

Sir, a controversy was raised About Anand Margis. In fact, the hon. Member, Shri Jethmalani, pleaded their case and so also Mr. Malkani...

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I didn't plead their case. I said: "If they are guilty, hang them."

SHRI S.B.CHAVAN: Whatever be the nature of the defence that you must have put up, my only point is, I am telling you what is contained in the investigation. I do not say anything more than what is contained in the information and the CBI report is that the needle of suspicion is definitely pointing towards the Anand Margis. But the whole thing has got to be confirmed. Unless corroborative evidence is there, merely because they are investigating and they are suspecting their involvement, we cannot possibly say that this is a conclusive evidence. And in this context I am really surprised how somebody has taken the name of the Home Secretary of West Bengal, coming with a very bold statement. In fact, we are interested in both aspects of the question: Who is responsible for conspiring and doing the entire thing and what is the end objective? In both the things we are interested. I do not know on what basis, if it is correct, it was said. And if the matter has been reported in the Press that he is on record to say "We know who are behind the whole thing and for what purpose the entire thing has been done", I do not take the responsibility of any kind of statement, but for assisting the CBI authorities if he has any such information, we will be grateful to him if he supplies that information, if he has any, so that we are able to reach proper conclusions.

It is very difficult. It is easier said than done. In international conspiracies it is not that easy. The whole thing is hatched in a proper manner. Every care is taken to see that there is no *iota* of evidence by which you will be able to catch

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

the person who, in fact, is behind the whole thing. If an officer of Home Secretary's level is saying that, I am sure, either he has been misquoted or he is saying something which he, in fact, is not supposed to say. But so far as I am concerned, I am only interested in getting the assistance, if he has any such information. Let him supply that information to the CBI officers and I am sure, the CBI will be definitely enlightened with the information that he may be supplying.

I do not hold any brief either for Anand Margis or for any other person. Unless I have some definite information, I cannot possibly say anything about that aspect of the question.

Sir, there is no denying the fact that in this intelligence apparatus and for the kind of action which needs to be taken in such cases,there are a large number of agencies which are involved. RAW is there. IB is there. Customs is there. Air Force Authority is there. The Civil Aviation Ministry is also there. There are four-five Ministries which, in fact, need to be coordinated. We had some kind of instructions on this issue, but the very fact that they could succeed in airdropping the arms in Purulia or whichever area they must have attempted, shows that the system definitely needs to be improved upon.I do not think that the system has served the purpose. It might be that this was not thought of at the particular time when these instructions were issued, but this has become a live issue because of this airdropping of the arms; that is why a committee was constituted and that committee went into the entire thing. I do not think that it will be proper for me to say anything because it is not going to help the hon. Members so much as it is going to help the enemy as to what the instructions are that the Government has issued and that is why I do not propose to give any details of the new guidelines which have been worked out by having all the agencies sitting together and creating a nodal agency, and I can assure this House that all the necessary steps will be taken and if anybody, whosoever he may be and howsoever high he may be, is foundguilty, then, of course, we will take the strictest action which Government can possibly think of, Anybody who has comitted any lapse will not be spared,but while doing so, we have to properly inquire into the matter and thereafter we will be able to take necessary steps in the matter. Sir, I have done.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir,...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S.AHLUWALIA: It is over. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MD. SALIM: I listened to you and you told me that ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): First the man who initiated the discussion. I have to see how far he is satisfied. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, if I have called the statement 'spurious', I call the reply 'casual'. It has been 'spurious' in the beginning. Now it is 'casual'. Sir, the hon.Home Minister does not admit it. There are only its and buts. He says that the system has to be strengthened. But has the system failed? I don't want any secret from him. He has his own way of looking at things. As long as he is the Minister of Home Affairs I have to abide by what he says. Will he admit before the House that there has been a colossal failure on the part of the apparatus that belongs to him? There may be different agencies but the Government is one and unambiguous. If the Government is one, there has been a colossal failure of the system and there has been a colossal failure on the part of the people who run the system and the people who are in charge of the system because there was information. As he says they had been alerted but no action was taken. That is why the system has to be improved upon. This is not the way. This is the way in which the Government always talks. When an amount of Rs. 10,000 crores was stolen from the national exchequer...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Home Minister about personal accountability. Number one,who is to be held responsible for not responding to the alert call? Number two, who is responsible for taking a decision that such a sensitive information should go by general post? Number three, if this has gone by general post, it has prevented the Governmentof West Bengal from taking preventive measures; otherwise, the entire consignment could have been recovered. Therefore, what steps would you like to take against the officer who in his own wisdom thought it proper to send it in a casual way?

Therefore, please let us know what you are going to do.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. Md. Salim, do you want to say something?

SHRI MD. SALIM: I will just put one question.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. Md. Salim, don't refer to the whole debate.

श्री मोहम्द सलीम: पहली बात यह कि हमने जॉइंट सेक्रेटरी के लेटर के बारे में जो सवाल उठाया था उन्होंने यह कहा और हम सब यह सवाल कर रहे थे कि गवर्नमेंट इस को सीरियस मानती है या नहीं? अब जिस तरह से उन्होंने सीरियसली जवाब दिया है तो मेरा पहला सवाल है कि ऑनरेबल होम मिनिस्टर यह स्टेटमेंट रख रहे हैं, तो उन्होंने यहां इस बात को क्यों नहीं कहा कि उन के पास इस के बारे में प्रायर इन्फॉर्मेशन थी? उन्होंने यह बात नहीं कही और अगर यह लेटर का मामला यहां नहीं आता, अगर यह पेपर ले नहीं होता तो हमारे हाउस को यह मालूम नहीं हो कि होम मिनिस्ट्री में क्या चल रहा है? ब्रिटिश गवर्नमेंट के बताने के बावजूद, he wanted to conceal. तो पहला सवाल है कि जो स्टेटमेंट उन्होंने यहां रखा है, वह इस हाउस को बताने के लिए है या इस हाउस से छिपाने के लिए है? उन्होंने सच्चाई को छिपाया है और इस का जवाब उन्हें इस हाउस में देना ही पड़ेगा। यहि उन को मानना पड़ेगा पर्सनली। He wanted to conceal this fact. That is why he did not deliverately mention this.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सतीश अग्रवाल)-आप यह कैसे कह सकते हैं कि मानना ही पड़ेगा? How can you force him to confess something?

SHRI MD. SALIM: It is our conclusion. (*Interruptions*) I wanted to put a question. He wanted an answer also from me.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): A confessional statement has to be voluntary. (*Interruptions*)... Mr. Ram Jethmalani, what is the legal position? It has to be voluntary.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: A confesasional statement has to be voluntary, Sir. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: If the accused does not co-operate, we have every right to grill the accused. (*Interruptions*)...

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, वह हमारे वरिष्ठ नेता हैं। फिर हम यहां जुम्मे के दिन घर न जाकर यहां बैठे हुए हैं और हाउस भी ऐसे चल नहीं रहा है। लोग सवाल उठाते हैं कि हाउस क्यों नहीं चलता है? हम लोग कहते हैं कि सरकार हम को बताना नहीं चाहती कुछ बात। इस बात का प्रमाण दे रहे हैं, वह मानें या न मानें। उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, यह 6 पेज का स्टेटमेंट है जिस में 16 पैराग्राफ हैं, मगर उस में यह नहीं बताया है कि हमारे होम मिनिस्टर को उस बारे में कुछ इनफॉर्मेशन थी और हम ने बिहार सरकार या बंगाल सरकार को देने की कोशिश की। उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, दूसरा क्युश्चन उन के जवाब से निकलता है। मान लिया कि इनफॉर्मेशन थी और उन्होंने कहा कि हम ने बिहार को बता दिया, बंगाल को भी बता दिया और यह मानते हैं कि इस भारत सरकार के होम मिनिस्टर और सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट की बिहार और बंगाल स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को बताने के अलावा और कोई जिम्मेदारी इंटेलीजेंस की, फोर्स की या हुकूमत की थी या नहीं? उन के जवाब से यह पता चलता है कि वह पोस्ट ऑफिस को भेज दिए थे। उस के बावजूद होम मिनिस्ट्री की और कोई जिम्मेदारी थी या नहीं? नंबर तीन....(व्यवधान).....

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सतीश अग्रवाल): आप क्वेश्चन नहीं पूछ रहे, आप तो कामेण्टस भी करने हैं।

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: मेरा क्वेश्चन है, सतीश अग्रवाल जी, मैंने कहा कि दोनों हुकुमत, स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को बताने के बावजूद.....(व्यवधान).....

†[انصاری محمد سلیم: میرا کوئیشچن ہے۔ ستیش اگروال جی میں نے کہا کہ دونوں حکومت (اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ کو بتانے کے باوجود۔۔۔ "مداخلت"۔۔۔]

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: यह क्या है? यह नाम लेकर कहेंगे चेयर को?

SHRI MD. SALIM: I stand corrected. I apologise.

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: यह सिनेमा हाल की तरह भाषण कर रहे हैं। आप थोड़े आराम से पूछिए। .....(व्यवधान).....

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: आप क्या बोल रहे हैं? क्या आप जब चाहेंगे, उठकर खड़े हो जाएंगे?

†[انصاری محمد سلیم: آپ کیا بول رہے ہیں۔ کیا آپ جب چاہیں گے، اٹھ کر کھڑے ہو جائیں گے]

†[] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: यह तरीका नहीं है। यह जवाब आ गया, अब यह कैसे क्रोस एग्जामिन कर रहे हैं?....(व्यवधान).....फिर भी आप सेटिसफाई नहीं होंगे।

कभी भी आप सेटिसफाई नहीं होंगे। .....(व्यवधान).....

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु: आप छिपाना चाहते हैं। .....(व्यवधान).....

श्री गुरुदास दासगुप्त: जरूर करना है।

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: टेबल मत ठोको।.....(व्यवधान).....

SHRI MD. SALIM: You suggest us what to do. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL) Mr. Ahluwalia, please take your seat.

(*Interruptions*)

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: मैंने सवाल पूछा कि होम मिनिस्टर साहब, होम मिनिस्टरी की स्टेट गवर्नमेंट को लेटर देने के बावजूद और कोई जिम्मेदारी है या नहीं?

†[شری محمد سلیم: میں نے سوال پوچھا کہ ہوم منسٹر صاحب ہوم منسٹری کی اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ کو لیٹر دینے کے باوجود اور کوئی ذمہ داری ہے یا نہیں؟]

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सतीश अग्रवाल): आपका यह सवाल हो गया। ज्यादा सवाल पूछेंगे तो सबका उत्तर नहीं आएगा।.....(व्यवधान).....

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, they don't want discussion. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we have completed the discussion. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Please take your seats. (*Interruptions*). Nothing will go on record hereafter. (*Interruptions*). Exchange of abuses will not go on record.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: *

SHRI MD. SALIM: *

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU : *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. Salim, please take your seat. Mr. Salim, I permitted you to seek certain clarifications.

गुजराल साहब, ऐसा है कि आप सवाल पूछ सकते हैं, जो उनके जवाब से उठते हों। नार्मली तो करते नहीं हैं, पर मैंने कहा कि सबको सेटिसफाई होना चाहिए क्योंकि इम्पोर्टेण्ट इस्यू है, नेशनल सिक्योरिटी का इस्यू है लेकिन, आप दुबारा वह सारी डिबेट करेंगो, जो कि हो चुकी है तो काम नहीं चलेगा।.....(व्यवधान).....

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, I seek your protection. I will just put questions.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, as a senior politician you will kindly appreciate that the hon. Minister of Home Affairs is avoiding all the questions. Even now he has not accepted whether this letter is in existence or not.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, I am not making any speech. These are the questions arising out of the reply given by the Home Minister. Firstly, I asked. "Why did he conceal that they had this information?" Secondly, he accepted that he communicated to the State Government. He also accepted that there was some gap because ordinary post was used. My second question was this. Apart from communicating to the State Government, do you have any other responsibilities as the Home Minister of the Government of India? (*Interruptions*). Leave it. Today is the International Women's Day.

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: (MAHARASHTRA): Thank you for showing this respect.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: श्रीमन्, जो बोल चुके हैं वही क्वेश्चन करते रहेंगे?.....(व्यवधान).....

जिन्होंने क्वेश्चन नहीं किया उनको तो मौका दीजिए।

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: अरे, क्वेश्चन कर रहे हैं मंत्री जी का यह कहना था कि.....(व्यवधान)..... उन्होंने नहीं किया रेप्लाई। यह क्वेश्चन है कि मद्रास में वह प्लेन जब लैण्ड किया, डी.जी.सी.ए. की बात कही कि परमीशन देना गलती हुआ। वह तो एक्सपेप्ट है, उस पर क्वेश्चन नहीं कर रहा, लेकिन जब वह प्लेन लौटकर आया मद्रास में, वहां से उड़कर गया तो जब प्लेन आइडेंटिफाई हो गया था तो मद्रास को ही इंफोरमेशन दे देनी चाहिए थी कि इसे रोककर अरेस्ट कर लेना चाहिए। सवाल यह आता है कि

†[شری محمد سلیم: ارے کوئشچن کر رہے ہیں۔ منتری جی کا یہ کہنا تھا کہ "مدراس"

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

انھوں نے نہیں کہا دیپالی - یہ کوئیشچن ہے کہ مدراس میں وہ پلین جب لینڈ کیا ڈی-جی-سی-اے- کی بات کہی کہ پرمیشن دینا غلطی ہوا- وہ تو ایکسیپٹ ہے اس پر کوئیشچن نہیں کر رہا- لیکن جب وہ پلین لوٹ کر گیا مدراس میں- وہاں سے اوکے کر گیا تو جب آئیڈینٹیفائی ہو گیا تھا تو مدراس کو بھی انفارمیشن دے دینی چاہیئے تھی کہ اسے روک کر انویسٹی گیٹ کر لینا چاہیئے- سوال یہ اٹھتا ہے کہ-

Already they had identified the plane.

लेकिन मद्रास को कम्युनिकेशन नहीं हुआ? बम्बई में जब उतरा तो एअरपोर्ट अथोरिटी को क्यों नहीं एलर्ट किया गया? .....(व्यवधान).....

مدراس کو کمیونیکیشن نہیں ہوا- بمبئی میں جب اترا تو ایئرپورٹ اتھارٹی کو کیوں نہیں الرٹ کیا گیا۔ "مداخلت"

उपसभाध्यक्ष: (श्री सतीश अग्रवाल): नहीं, नहीं आप जो है, मिस्टर सलीम .....(व्यवधान).....I am sorry. You are raking the issues again and again. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta had put pertinent questions. In examination also there are 10 questions and you are given the option to answer six questions only. It is not necessary that he replies to all the questions. He has to answer relevant questions. Mr. Jethmalani raised certain important questions. Shri Gurudas Das Gupta also raised certain important questions.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: But he cannot avoid compulsory questions ...(*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): That is why I am permitting you to only put those questions which he will have to reply under compulsion.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, my last question is this. He has conceded, that...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Supposing again he does not reply to it. Then we will have a third round.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, as a result of liberalisation...(*Interruptions*)... 200 aircraft cross the airspace either they cross or land. This is a very large number. This means that we did not have the apparatus to tackle this problem. Now we have opted for liberalisation. Are you going to make arrangements so that the problems that we are faced with can be tackled.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: I have only one question to put to my hon. friend.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): The shorter the question, the better would be the reply.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: When the report from the British Intelligence came, up to what level was it reported? Was it reported up to the Home Minister's level? Was it brought to the notice of the Defence Minister? Was it reported up to the level of the Prime Minister? Or, was it disposed of at the Deputy Secretary's and Joint Secretary's level? Secondly, after this event, a truck carrying arms was caught in Delhi. Is it that there was some link between the two incidents? If there was a link, what was the conclusion? Thirdly, when the intelligence report was available, was the Civil Aviation Department cautioned that there was a possibility of a plane coming like this? Was the Varanasi airport cautioned because Varanasi was also mentioned in the report? Was the Madras airport cautioned? Lastly, if all these people were cautioned, has responsibility been fixed on them? Did they get the intelligence report or was it that only two State Governments were informed?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: I want to put one question. Trespass of a plane reported to be carrying arms for being smuggled into the country. This is a Central subject to which the executive authority of the Centre extends. Dropping of arms in India is a subject-matter of our defence and security, which is also a Central subject. The executive authority of the Government of India extends to both these topics. How is it that your Ministry thought that

by merely writing a letter to the State Government, you could thereafter go to sleep? You thought that this was merely a problem of law and order and the State Government alone would be interested in it. This is where the negligence of the Centre comes in. Wahi is this question that you have referred to the Law Ministry? Please tell us about it. Don't you know that this matter is within your own jurisdiction?

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: It is regarding the Customs...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Even Customs is a Central subject. You knew that you have to take continuous steps to safeguard the country against smuggling, particularly smuggling of arms. Why did you rest content after merely writing a letter to the State Government and treating it as a law and order problem?

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): The hon. Minister did mention in his reply that the Government in Myanmar refused prmission for landing. We have diplomatic relations with Myanmar Government. I think that they must have refused it for obvious reasons. The way in which we were alerted by the Interpol, Myanmar Government must have also been alerted. Was there any exchange of information between the Government of Myanmar and the Government of India? Was the Home Ministry informed, or was the Government of India informed through diplomatic channels? The second point that I want to raise is about the secret documents. What is the procedure adopted by the Government of India to send secret documents to the States and different countries? Do you use ordinary mail or do you use courier services?

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Purulia has given rise to a number of questions. I am sorry to say that the hon. Home Minister's statement does not answer any of these questions. In Varanasi, in Madras and elsewhere, the ATCs grossly failed in their duty. They were suspended and have since been reinstated. We would like to know, why. In Madras they insisted that instructions should be given to them in writing. By the time the instructions were given in writing, the plane had taken off. This is a serious matter. It is quite possible that the Home Minister does not have the information right now. But he can let us know subsequently, may be, in a day or two. The second question is that these conspirators have their agents in India. All of them have been bailed out. Why is the Government of India not appealing against it? Thirdly, most of these arms, probably, all the arms were dropped in West Bengal. But a bulk of them are supposed to have been whisked away to Bihar. Have any arms been seized from Bihar? If not, why not? I would request the hon. Home Minister to go into this matter and let the House know about it. Thank you.

Have any arms been captured in Bihar? If not, why not? I would request the hon. Minister to go into this question and let the House know.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: महोदय, मैं एक सवाल पूछना चाहता हूं... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सतीश अग्रवाल): ऐसा है कि जितने ज्यादा सवाल होंगे उतने कम उत्तर दिए जाएंगे। कुछ प्वाइंटेड क्वश्चन आ गए हैं, जो मुझे रेलवेंट लगते हैं, उनका जवाब आ जाने दीजिए।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: श्रीमन, मै केवल एक सवाल करूंगा। मंत्री जी ने कुछ चीजें साफ की हैं, उनको मैं रिपोर्ट नहीं करूंगा। जब यहां पर इन्फॉरमेशन आ गई और यह भी आपने मान लिया कि चिट्ठी आर्डिनरी पोस्ट से गई तो रजिस्टर्ड पोस्ट से भेजने का दावा क्यों किया गया? महोदय, मैं यह भी पूछना चाहूंगा कि आपने डॉयरेक्टर जनरल सिविल ऐवियेशन को या अन्य किसी ऐथोरिटी को क्यों इन्फॉर्म नहीं किया? क्या कोई लीगल बाधा थी कि ज्वाइंट सेकेटरी बंगाल गवर्नमेंट को तो चिट्ठी भेजता है लेकिन डॉयरेक्टर जनरल सिविल ऐवियेशन को कोई इन्फॉर्म नहीं करता? जब इस बारे में इन्फॉर्मेशन आई थी तो उन्होंने कम से कम डॉयरेक्टर जनरल सिविल ऐवियेशन को इन्फॉरमेशन देने के लिए ताकीद क्यों नहीं की, यह मैं जानना चाहता हूं।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. Home Minister, you try to answer as many questions as possible.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: Sir, I do not want to repeat any reply that I gave already. I have already conceded that there have been certain lacunae in the system. And you want me to say that the system has totally failed...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: On this occasion, it has failed.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: The very fact that I am saying that there is a certain lacuna in the co-ordination part is good enough for anyone to understand that this lacuna needs to be plugged...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The English vocabulary gives you all the escape routes.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: I think that it definitely indicates a number of things for which the Committee was constituted. And as I have already stated, there are certain things about which unless we get the full report of the CBI, it will be difficult for me to say against which officer the action is proposed to be taken. Action, definitely, will be taken but it has to be corroborated by certain things on the basis of record and on the basis of the report of the CBI. So, before that, I don't think that it will be possible for me to say that this officer or that officer is going to be held responsible...(*Interruptions*) Another thing about which I would like to inform the House is that the information was not merely given to the West Bengal and the Bihar Governments. There are other departments who were also informed about it and the Co-ordination Committee, in which various agencies which were concerned about it are represented, was also involved. So, everybody was informed about it. These two State Governments were informed because they do not form part of the co-ordinating agency. That is why definite information was supplied to them. Sir, about Madras, whatever Mr. Malkani ...(*Interruptions*) Just a minute...(*Interruptions*) I won't reply to you...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Why was it sent by a general post? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: I am not going to reply...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: He has to inform us why this letter was sent by a general post...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MD. SALIM: You want to defend that officer...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): He is not defending anybody...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MD. SALIM: When you knew the fact, why didn't you disclose? (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, Mr. Salim,...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let the Minister be honest. We expect honesty from the Government, nothing more...(*Interruptions*)

Let the Minister be honest like me and admit that this was a serious failure and that the officer concerned would be taken to task. Let this be done.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SATISH AGARWAL): He has said that this aspect is being looked into. He assured the House that action would be taken. Until now we have carried the discussion in a very nice manner. We are about to conclude the discussion without having to call you tomorrow. Now I adjourn the House till 11.00 a.m. on Monday.

The House then adjourned at forty-six minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Monday, the 11th March, 1996.

101/MP/RSS/ND/97—300 Copies—December 98—MGITBPChdg.